

---

Volume 62  
Issue 3 *Spring 2013: Symposium - Class Action  
Rollback? Wal-Mart v. Dukes and the Future of  
Class Action Litigation*

---

Article 1

## Table of Contents

DePaul College of Law

Follow this and additional works at: <https://via.library.depaul.edu/law-review>

---

### Recommended Citation

DePaul College of Law, *Table of Contents*, 62 DePaul L. Rev. (2013)  
Available at: <https://via.library.depaul.edu/law-review/vol62/iss3/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Law at Via Sapientiae. It has been accepted for inclusion in DePaul Law Review by an authorized editor of Via Sapientiae. For more information, please contact [digitalservices@depaul.edu](mailto:digitalservices@depaul.edu).

# DEPAUL LAW REVIEW

Volume 62

Spring 2013

Number 3

## CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM  
CLASS ACTION ROLLBACK?  
*WAL-MART V. DUKES* AND THE FUTURE OF CLASS  
ACTION LITIGATION

TWENTY-SECOND ANNUAL DEPAUL LAW REVIEW SYMPOSIUM

INTRODUCTION ..... *Christopher S. Burrichter* 653

### ARTICLES

THE POWER AND PROMISE OF PROCEDURE:  
EXAMINING THE CLASS ACTION LANDSCAPE  
AFTER *WAL-MART V. DUKES*..... *Suzette M. Malveaux* 659

DOOMSDAY DELAYED: HOW THE COURT'S  
PARTY-NEUTRAL CLARIFICATION OF CLASS  
CERTIFICATION STANDARDS IN *WAL-MART*  
*V. DUKES* ACTUALLY HELPS PLAINTIFFS .... *Anthony F. Fata* 675

OPTIMAL CLASS SIZE, *DUKES*, AND THE  
FUNNY THING ABOUT *SHADY GROVE*.. *William H.J. Hubbard* 693

IMPLAUSIBLE INJURIES: *WAL-MART V.*  
*DUKES* AND THE FUTURE OF CLASS  
ACTIONS AND EMPLOYMENT  
DISCRIMINATION CASES ..... *Marcia L. McCormick* 711

ISSUE CERTIFICATION UNDER RULE 23(C)(4):  
A REAPPRAISAL ..... *Mark A. Perry* 733

“CARVING AT THE JOINT”: THE PRECISE  
FUNCTION OF RULE 23(C)(4) ..... *Patricia Bronte* 745  
*George Robot*  
*Darin M. Williams*

THE FAMILY AND THE MARKET  
AT *WAL-MART*..... *Naomi Schoenbaum* 759

REACTIONS TO *WAL-MART V. DUKES*:  
LITIGATION STRATEGY AND  
LEGAL CHANGE ..... *Andrew J. Trask* 791

EXTRALEGAL WHITEWASHES ..... *Lesley Wexler* 817

#### COMMENTS

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE NOT DEFENDING  
THE DEFENSE OF MARRIAGE ACT:  
POLITICALLY SIGNIFICANT,  
LEGALLY IRRELEVANT?..... *Angelo DiBartolomeo* 857

MAJOR LEAGUE SOCCER SCORES AN  
OWN GOAL: A SUCCESSFUL JOINT  
VENTURE ATTAINS MARKET POWER  
IN AN INTERNATIONAL SPORT ..... *Mark W. Lenihan* 881

Cite as 62 DEPAUL L. REV.  
Copyright © 2013 DePaul University  
All Rights Reserved  
DePaul Law Review

---

---

The *DePaul Law Review* (ISSN 0011-7188) is published quarterly by DePaul University College of Law, 25 East Jackson Boulevard, Chicago, Illinois 60604-2287. Periodicals postage paid at Chicago, Illinois and additional mailing offices. Change of addresses should be mailed to the *Review* at least thirty days before the next issue to ensure delivery. Include new and old addresses, with ZIP codes. POSTMASTER: send change of address notice to DePaul Law Review, 25 East Jackson Boulevard, Chicago, Illinois 60604-2287.

**SUBSCRIPTIONS:** Subscriptions are accepted on a per volume basis only. They are payable in advance and will be renewed automatically unless notification to the contrary is received. The annual price for a subscription to the *DePaul Law Review* is \$30.00.

**SINGLE & BACK ISSUES:** Back issues of the *DePaul Law Review* can be obtained directly from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209. The cost is \$16.00 plus shipping for a single issue. For more information, call 1-800-828-7571. Single copies of the most current issue are also available for sale at the *Law Review* office. The cost is \$10.00.

**MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION:** Manuscripts submitted for publication in the *DePaul Law Review* must be typed and double spaced with footnotes appended to the main body of the article. Citations must conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010), copyright by the *Columbia, Harvard, and University of Pennsylvania Law Reviews* and the *Yale Law Journal*. Send manuscripts to the *Law Review* offices at 25 East Jackson Boulevard, Chicago, Illinois 60604-2287. Manuscripts will not be returned unless specifically requested.

**LAW REVIEW WEBSITE:** For more information, visit our website at [www.law.depaul.edu](http://www.law.depaul.edu).

*DePaul University is an equal-opportunity educator and employer.*



# DEPAUL LAW REVIEW

Volume 62

Spring 2013

Number 3

## BOARD OF EDITORS

JOSHUA T. SCARBOROUGH  
*Editor in Chief*

DARIN M. WILLIAMS  
*Executive Editor*

SEAN T.H. DUTTON  
*Managing Editor of Lead Articles*

MARK LENIHAN  
*Managing Editor of Notes and Comments*

STEPHANIE MULCAHY  
*Symposium Editor*

MICHAEL O. PRESBITERO III  
*Business Manager*

ANGELO DiBARTOLOMEO  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

JORDAN MOBLEY  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

REBECCA STANG  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

MATT DOSTAL  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

KENAN PETERSON  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

ELISE ADDIS  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

KRISTEN JACKSON  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes, and Comments*

BRITNEY ZILZ  
*Editor of Articles,  
Notes and Comments*

## MEMBERS

ANTHONY AMORINI  
JACK A. BATTAGLIA  
DANIEL HAAS  
DARRON HUBBARD  
SARA JACOBS

RACHELLE KETCHUM  
TIMOTHY MALHAM  
MEGAN NATALINO  
ELIZABETH POWELL

JUSTIN REDEKER  
JENI ROBERTS  
DANIEL SYLVESTER  
THOMAS WANGARD  
PAUL WINTERS

## STAFF

MICHAEL CANNELL  
DANIEL CONNORS  
REGINA COUTO  
ANDREW DONIVAN  
KARA FRANCIS  
ALEXANDER GERTEIS  
SYDNEY HUTT  
EMILY JENKINSON  
TARA KENNEDY

CHRISTINA KUROW  
ABBEY LERNER  
STEPHANIE LOMBARDI  
COURTNEY MATHEWS  
KYLE MOLIDOR  
MEGHAN MOORE  
JENNA MORAN  
PASQUALE A. NERI  
MATTHEW NOVARIA  
DREW REDMOND

JONATHON REINISCH  
AARON SCHNEIDER  
BRADEN SHAW  
KYLE SIMCOX  
SAMANTHA SOMMERMAN  
EMILY STEINBERG  
ROBIN WAGNER  
BRIAN WEBB  
KEVIN WENDER

## FACULTY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

JEFFREY M. SHAMAN  
*Chairperson*

SUMI K. CHO  
MAX HELVESTON

DONALD H.J. HERMANN  
MICHAEL S. JACOBS

STEPHAN LANDSMAN  
MARK MOLLER  
ALLISON ORTLIEB  
STEPHEN SIEGEL

MEMBER, NATIONAL CONFERENCE OF LAW REVIEWS

# DEPAUL UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF LAW

## GENERAL ADMINISTRATION

REV. DENNIS H. HOLTSCHNEIDER, C.M., Ed.D., President  
REV. JOHN T. RICHARDSON, C.M., Chancellor  
Patricia D. O'Donoghue, Interim Provost  
ROBERT L. KOZOMAN, C.P.A., Executive Vice President  
REV. EDWARD R. UDOVIC, C.M., Ph.D., Secretary of the University  
JEFFREY J. BETHKE, Treasurer of the University  
J.D. BINDENAGEL, Vice President for Community, Government, & International Affairs  
JAY BRAATZ, Ed.D., Vice President for Planning & Presidential Administration  
CINDY SUMMERS, Interim Vice President for Student Affairs  
MARY C. FINGER, Senior Vice President for Advancement  
BONNIE FRANKEL, C.P.A., Vice President for Finance  
MARK HAWKINS, Controller  
ROBERT JANIS, Vice President for Facilities Operations  
DAVID H. KALSBECK, Ph.D., Senior Vice President for Enrollment Management & Marketing  
CINDY LAWSON, Vice President of Public Relations and Communications  
BOB MCCORMICK, Vice President for Information Services  
PATRICIA O'DONOGHUE, Vice President for Alumni Outreach & Engagement  
ELIZABETH F. ORTIZ, Ed.D., Vice President for Institutional Diversity & Equity  
JOSÉ D. PADILLA, J.D., Vice President and General Counsel

## LAW ADMINISTRATION

GREGORY MARK, Dean  
DAVID L. FRANKLIN, Vice Dean  
MICHAEL S. BURNS, Dean, Admissions & Student Administration  
WILLIAM CHAMBERLAIN, Dean, Law Career Services  
STEVEN R. GREENBERGER, Dean of Faculty  
BRIAN F. HAVEL, Dean for Administration  
NANCY HERSHFIELD, Dean, Development & Alumni Relations  
DEBORAH HOWARD, Dean of Institutional Strategy, Planning  
ANGELA LILLY, Chief of Staff & Operations  
ANDREA D. LYON, Dean of Clinical Programs  
KORTNEY MOORE, Director, Marketing & Communications  
HOWARD M. RUBIN, Dean for Lawyering Skills  
FRANCINE SOULINAS, Dean, Strategic Community Alliances  
SUSAN E. THROWER, Director, Legal Writing & Research Program  
DIANA C. WHITE, Dean, Student Affairs

## LAW FACULTY

BENJAMIN E. ALBA, Instructor: B.S., DePaul University; J.D., Loyola University of Chicago  
SIOBAN ALBIOL, Instructor: B.A., University of Texas; J.D., Loyola University of Chicago  
PHILLIP S. ASHLEY, Associate Professor: B.A., Rockford College; J.D., Tulsa University; LL.M., New York University  
M. CHERIF BASSIOUNI, Distinguished Research Professor: J.D., Indiana University; LL.M., John Marshall Law School; S.J.D., George Washington University  
MARY BECKER, Distinguished Research Professor: B.S., Loyola University of Chicago; J.D., University of Chicago  
MARY ANN BECKER, Instructor: B.A., Northwestern University; J.D., DePaul University  
MONU BEDI, Assistant Professor: B.A., Dartmouth College; M.Phil, University of Cambridge, U.K.; J.D., Harvard  
BARBARA B. BRESSLER, Associate Professor: B.S., University of Minnesota; J.D., DePaul University  
EMILY CAUBLE, Visiting Professor:  
LEONARD L. CAVISE, Professor: B.A., Hamilton College; J.D., Georgetown University  
SUMI K. CHO, Professor: B.A., J.D., Ph.D., University of California

ALBERTO R. COLL, Professor: B.A., Princeton University; J.D., Ph.D., University of Virginia  
MICHELLE BROWN CUE, Instructor: B.A., University of Illinois; J.D., University of Illinois  
JOHN F. DECKER, Professor Emeritus: B.A., University of Iowa; J.D., Creighton University; LL.M., New York University; J.S.D., New York University  
GRAEME B. DINWOODIE, Visiting Professor: L.B. Glasgow University; LL.M., Harvard Law School; J.S.D. Columbia Law School  
KATHERYN M. DUTENHAVER, Associate Professor: B.A., North Central College; J.D., DePaul University  
FREEMAN L. FARROW, Assistant Professor: B.A., Amherst College; M.D., University of Massachusetts Medical School; J.D., University of Michigan  
DAVID L. FRANKLIN, Associate Professor: B.A., Yale College; J.D., University of Chicago  
JEROLD A. FRIEDLAND, Professor: B.A., M.A., New York University; J.D., Brooklyn Law School; LL.M., Georgetown University  
STEPHANIE FUSCO, Visiting Professor: J.S.D. Stanford; J.S.M.; M.B.A.; LL.M  
PATTY GERSTENBLITH, Distinguished Research Professor: A.B., Bryn Mawr College; Ph.D., Harvard University; J.D., Northwestern University  
ANDREW GOLD, Associate Professor: B.A., Dartmouth College; J.D., Duke University  
STEVEN R. GREENBERGER, Associate Professor: B.A., University of Illinois; J.D., Yale University  
MICHAEL GRYNBERG, Associate Professor: B.A., Carleton College; J.D. University of Virginia School of Law  
RAYMOND J. GRZEBIELSKI, Associate Professor: B.A., Northwestern University; M.B.A., University of Chicago; J.D., Northwestern University; LL.M., Georgetown University  
BRIAN F. HAVEL, Professor: B.A., M.A., B.C.L., University of Dublin; LL.M., J.S.D., Columbia University  
MAX HELVESTON, Assistant Professor: B.A., University of Michigan; J.D., Yale University  
DONALD H.J. HERMANN, Professor: A.B., Stanford University; M.A., Northwestern University; J.D., Columbia University; LL.M., Harvard University; Ph.D., Northwestern University; M.A.A.H., Art Institute of Chicago  
MICHAEL S. JACOBS, Distinguished Research Professor: B.A., Dartmouth College; J.D., Yale University; M.P.H., Johns Hopkins University  
BARRY KELLMAN, Professor: B.A., University of Chicago; J.D., Yale University  
SANDRA KUPELIAN, Instructor: B.A., University of Wisconsin; J.D., DePaul University  
ROBERTA R. KWALL, Raymond P. Niro Professor of Intellectual Property: A.B., Brown University; J.D., University of Pennsylvania  
STEPHAN A. LANDSMAN, Robert A. Clifford Professor of Tort Law and Public Policy: B.A., Kenyon College; J.D., Harvard University  
JULIE D. LAWTON, Assistant Professor: B.S., Florida A&M University; J.D., Howard University; LL.M., Georgetown University  
WAYNE K. LEWIS, Professor: B.A., Rutgers University; J.D., Cornell University  
MARGIT LIVINGSTON, Professor: B.A., Augsburg College; M.A., J.D., University of Minnesota; LL.M., University of Illinois  
ANDREA D. LYON, Professor: B.A., Rutgers University; J.D., Antioch School of Law  
JODY MARCUCCI, Instructor: B.A., University of Wisconsin; J.D., DePaul University  
GREGORY MARK, Dean: B.A., Butler University; J.D., University of Chicago; M.A., Harvard University  
CARY MARTIN, Assistant Professor: B.S., University of Illinois; J.D. Northwestern University School of Law  
PAUL S. MILLER, Instructor: M.F.A., Temple University Tyler School of Art; J.D., Fordham University  
MARK MOLLER, Assistant Professor: B.A., Duke University; J.D., University of Chicago Law School; LL.M., University of Cambridge  
DANIEL I. MORALES, Assistant Professor: B.A., Williams College; J.D., Yale University  
ALLEN MOYE, Associate Professor: B.A., Howard University; J.D., University of Richmond; M.L.S., Catholic University  
MARLENE NICHOLSON, Emeritus Professor: B.A., J.D., University of California at Los Angeles  
ALLISON I. ORTLIEB, Instructor: B.A., J.D., University of Chicago  
BRUCE L. OTTLEY, Professor: B.A., University of Missouri; M.A., University of Iowa; J.D., University of Iowa; LL.M., Columbia University  
MARTHA PAGLIARI, Instructor: B.A., University of Notre Dame; J.D., DePaul University  
STEVEN RESNICOFF, Professor: B.A., Princeton University; J.D., Yale University  
JOHN C. ROBERTS, Professor: B.S., Northwestern University; LL.B., Yale University



ZOË ROBINSON, Assistant Professor: B.Mus., Queensland Conservatorium of Music, Griffith University; B.A., Australian National University; LL.B., Australian National University; J.D., University of Chicago

DAVID RODRIGUEZ, Visiting Professor: B.S., University of Illinois; J.D., University of Michigan

HOWARD M. RUBIN, Associate Professor: B.A., University of Illinois; J.D., DePaul University

JANE RUTHERFORD, Professor: A.B., University of Chicago; J.D., University of Michigan

JOSHUA D. SARNOFF, Professor: B.S., Massachusetts Institute of Technology; J.D., Stanford University

STEPHEN A. SIEGEL, Distinguished Research Professor: B.A., Columbia University; J.D., LL.M., Harvard University

ROBERT SMITH, Visiting Professor: B.A., University of California; J.D., Harvard University

TERRY SMITH, Distinguished Research Professor: B.A., Brown University; J.D., New York University

WILLIAM W. STUART, Professor: B.A., Stanford University; LL.B., Washington and Lee University

SUSAN E. THROWER, Associate Professor: B.A., University of Virginia; J.D., Wake Forest University

ALLISON BROWNELL TIRRES, Assistant Professor: B.A., Princeton University; M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Harvard University

DEBORAH TUERKHEIMER, Professor: B.A., Harvard University; J.D., Yale Law School

VINCENT VITULLO, Emeritus Professor: A.B., J.D., Loyola University of Chicago; LL.M., Yale University

ANTHONY G. VOLINI, Instructor: B.S., Benedictine University; J.D., Loyola University of Chicago

MARK C. WEBER, Vincent de Paul Professor of Law: B.A., Columbia University; J.D., Yale University

JUDGE WARREN D. WOLFSON, Distinguished Visiting Professor: B.S., University of Illinois at Chicago; LL.B., University of Illinois

### VINCENT G. RINN LAW LIBRARY

ALLEN R. MOYE, Director & Associate Professor: B.A., Howard University; J.D., University of Richmond; M.L.S., Catholic University

WALTER BAUMAN, Librarian, Government Documents: B.A., University of Illinois at Chicago; M.L.S., Rosary College

MARK GIANGRANDE, Librarian, Legal Research Specialist: B.S., Northwestern University; J.D., IIT Chicago-Kent; M.L.S., University of Texas

DENISE GLYNN, Librarian, Head of Cataloging: B.S., Northern Illinois University; M.L.S., Rosary College

MILTA HALL, Associate Director, Public Services: B.A., Memphis State University; M.A., University of Wisconsin, University of Illinois; J.D., DePaul University

MARY LU LINNANE, Associate Director, Technical Services: B.A., Marquette University; M.L.S., University of Wisconsin at Milwaukee

MICHAEL SCHIFFER, Associate Director, Computer Services: B.A., University of Chicago; J.D., University of Michigan; M.L.S., Rosary College

MARIA WILMER, Librarian, Legal Research Specialist: B.A., A.M.L.S., University of Michigan

## ADJUNCT FACULTY

JEFF ATKINSON, J.D.  
MICHAEL BERGMANN, J.D.  
STEVE BRANSTEDT, J.D.  
CATHERINE BREMER, J.D.  
HON. MARY M. BROSNAHAN, J.D.  
VINCENT BROWNE, J.D.  
PATRICK BRUKS, J.D.  
HON. ANTHONY CALABRESE, J.D.  
ZACHARY CALO, J.D.  
MARY ANNE CAPRON, J.D.  
NATALIE CARLOMANGO, J.D.  
CHRISTOPHER CARMICHAEL, J.D.  
PATRICK CASSIDY, J.D.  
JAMES CLARK, J.D.  
MICHAEL CLARK, J.D.  
ZACHARY CLOPTON, J.D.  
BRIAN COLLINS, J.D.  
KAREN CONTI, J.D.  
SUSAN COX, J.D.  
JULES CRYSTAL, J.D.  
DANIEL CULLEN, J.D.  
CATHERINE DIEBEL, J.D.  
KELLI DUDLEY, J.D.  
COLIN DUNN, J.D.  
BRAD EBNER, J.D.  
BRADLEY ERENS, J.D.  
PAUL FINE, J.D.  
LAWRENCE FOX, J.D.  
ROBERT GEVIRTZ, J.D.  
HON. DANIEL GILLESPIE, J.D.  
LEONARD GOODMAN, J.D.  
ELLEN GUTIONTOV, J.D.  
SUSAN HADDAD, J.D.

MARIA HARRIGAN, J.D.  
TIMOTHY HOFFMANN, J.D.  
HON. JACK HYNES, J.D.  
THOMAS JUDGE, J.D.  
LILIANNA KALIN, J.D.  
SUSAN L. KENNEDY, J.D.  
CHERYL KETTLER, J.D.  
BRENT KIDWELL, J.D.  
HON. JOHN KIRBY, J.D.  
KENNETH KRAUS, J.D.  
MICHAEL KRZAK, J.D.  
ROBERT LABATE, J.D.  
LESLIE LANDES, J.D.  
VALARIE LEOPOLD, J.D.  
LISA LEVINE, J.D.  
IRVING LEVINSON, J.D.  
BRIAN LEWIS, J.D.  
O. GREGORY LEWIS, J.D.  
KATY LEWIS, J.D.  
ROBERT LOEB, J.D.  
MARY RITA LUECKE, J.D.  
TERRENCE MACCARTHY, J.D.  
SCOTT MAIN, J.D.  
CRYSTAL MARCHIGIANI, J.D.  
SIBYL MEDIE, J.D.  
ALAN MILLS, J.D.  
JOEY MOGUL, J.D.  
SANDY MORRIS, J.D.  
MICHAEL MORRISSEY, J.D.  
ANDREW MOSHIRNIA, J.D.  
CRAIG MOUSIN, J.D.  
LAURENCE MRAZ, J.D.

JOHN MULLIGAN, J.D.  
BRIAN NACH, J.D.  
PETER NEWMAN, J.D.  
JENNIFER NIEMEC DUNN, J.D.  
KEVIN NOONAN, J.D.  
KEVIN PAK, J.D.  
JOHN PANIAGUAS, J.D.  
DEBORAH PERGAMENT, J.D.  
JAY READEY, J.D.  
TIMO REHBOCK, J.D.  
TRISH RICH, J.D.  
MARTIN ROBINS, J.D.  
SUSAN SCHIERL SULLIVAN, J.D.  
JOHN SCHMIDT, J.D.  
KATHERINE SCHOSTOK, J.D.  
HELENE SHAPO, J.D.  
SAM SHIM, J.D.  
JOEL SIMBERG, J.D.  
JAMES SIMON, J.D.  
ELIZABETH SIMON, J.D.  
JULIE LIVERGOOD SIMPSON, J.D.  
STANLEY SKLAR, J.D.  
BARRY SPECTOR, J.D.  
KATHRYN STARSHAK, J.D.  
GERALDINE STROKA, J.D.  
LAWRENCE SWIBEL, J.D.  
JILL TANZ, J.D.  
JOI THOMAS, J.D.  
JOSEPH THOMPSON, J.D.  
ELIZABETH VISTINE, J.D.  
TORRICK WARD, J.D.  
LAURA WEILER, J.D.

