3-2012

Indigenous art in urban renewal: The emergence and development of artistic communitites in midwetern post-industrial cities

William Covert
DePaul University, WILLIAMCOVERT85@YAHOO.COM

Recommended Citation
http://via.library.depaul.edu/etd/114

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences at Via Sapientiae. It has been accepted for inclusion in College of Liberal Arts & Social Sciences Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Via Sapientiae. For more information, please contact mbernal2@depaul.edu.
INDIGENOUS ART IN URBAN RENEWAL:  
THE EMERGENCE AND DEVELOPMENT OF ARTISTIC COMMUNITIES IN MIDWESTERN POST-INDUSTRIAL CITIES  

A Thesis  
Presented in  
Partial Fulfillment of the  
Requirements for the Degree of  
Master of Science  

March, 2012  

BY  
William Covert  

School of Public Service  
College of Liberal Arts and Sciences  
DePaul University  
Chicago, Illinois
ABSTRACT

Art has been shown in the academic literature to have potentially transformative effects on urban neighborhoods. Artistic communities in particular strengthen community participation and leadership, create a nightlife that can support business, low crime, and attract tourists.

Policy makers, however, often lack understanding of how artist communities function and how these enclaves can enhance the development and sustainability of neighborhoods. Many policymakers lack technical understanding of the differing outcomes that a “top-down approach” and “bottom-up” approach have on the creation, expansion, and evolution of artist communities.

This research attempts to develop insights into the strengths and weaknesses of differing approaches to the development of artist communities through case-study analysis of four post-industrial cities: Chicago, Illinois; Detroit, Michigan; Grand Rapids, Michigan; and Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Through intensive site visits to these Midwestern cities conducted over a six-month period in 2011 as well as interviews with artists, community leaders, and urban planners with expertise in the field, the study develops perspectives on the role of planning in shaping the character of these places.

The results show that as post-industrial cities undergo a transformation in government, culture, and policy, artist communities have the ability to revitalize decaying neighborhoods in a variety of ways. Each city has cultivated a different approach to promoting art through a lengthy process of trial and error. Detroit has a vibrant grassroots based artistic community emerging with visible impact on urban renewal of the city. Grand Rapids can be summarized as developing an artistic community that is heavily reliant on corporate and philanthropic funding with minimal government interaction, and less direct impact on urban renewal. Pittsburgh features a central planning approach to create an emerging artistic culture, and contains heavy government and philanthropic involvement in cultivating urban redevelopment. Chicago features elements of all three cities, but is also experiencing artistic communities developing at a much faster rate and has greater autonomy than the other three cities studied. In each case, however, art has shown great promise in restoring the cultural fabric of cities that had been lost due to decades of divestment.
CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES 4
LIST OF FIGURES 4

Chapter

ONE INTRODUCTION 5

TWO BACKGROUND 8
  Artistic Impact on New Urbanism in New York City 9
  Artistic Impact on Community Redevelopment in Paducah 10
  Artistic Impact on Urban Renewal in the Rustbelt 11

THREE LITERATURE REVIEW 18

FOUR METHODOLOGY 22

FIVE CASE STUDY 1: DETROIT 30
  History 35
  Policy Issues 38
  Findings 40

SIX CASE STUDY 2: GRAND RAPIDS 47
  History 51
  Policy Issues 55
  Findings 58

SEVEN CASE STUDY 3: PITTSBURGH 65
  History 71
  Policy Issues 73
  Findings 75

EIGHT COMPARITIVE ANALYSIS: CHICAGO 81

NINE CONCLUSION 92
  Key Finding 1: Urban Planning’s Effect on the Creative Environment 92
  Key Finding 2: Impact of Philanthropy 95
  Key Finding 3: Cohesion Between Artists & Community Residents 96
  Key Finding 4: Artist Impact on Urban Redesign 97
  Key Finding 5: Fragility of Grassroots Movements 99
  Key Finding 6: Need For Further Research 101

RESOURCES 103
TABLES

1. Details of City Selection Criteria 24
2. Details of Site Visits 25

FIGURES

1. Schematics of Notable Artistic Neighborhoods in Detroit, Michigan 31
2. Schematics of the Neighborhoods in Grand Rapids, Michigan, Featuring Sites of Artistic Activity 48
3. Schematics of Artistic Community Sites Located in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 67
4. Schematics of Artistic Community Sites in Chicago, Illinois 82
CHAPTER 1:
INTRODUCTION

City neighborhoods are dynamic places that undergo constant change. In some cases, the change is due to comprehensive urban-planning initiatives. In others, it is due to spontaneous market and social forces. Exactly why and how artistic communities grow, prosper, and evolve within cities, however, is not widely understood. Artistic communities are often the focus of progressive urban planning efforts and by most accounts, tend to be populated by younger residents and those favorably inclined to use city services such as public transportation.

The prestige of having a vibrant “creative class” often makes artist communities attractive candidates for public investment. Yet, there is little consensus on what policies work best. On one hand, a strong “counter-cultural” element pervades many artistic communities, suggesting that they will be most vibrant when allowed to evolve organically through grass-roots efforts. Policy expects such as Richard Lloyd, Elizabeth Currid, and Richard Florida fear that a strong, centralized force can have a homogenizing effect. On the other hand, many fledgling artistic communities struggle or vanish when local governments ignore them.

Generally, the most vibrant artistic communities have characteristics that render them to become sustainable and closely integrated with densely populated urban centers. Artistic communities have also historically catered to the anti-gentrification movement and have been known to have widely diverse populations while being located within or near minority or immigrant neighborhoods. Residents of these neighborhoods may find themselves suddenly more involved with the arts and more active in the use of city services due to the vitality that the artistic populations bring. These areas also develop a sense of neighborhood and “camaraderie.”
This thesis explores the extent to which the development of artistic communities is reliant on urban planning and the extent to which it is dependent on spontaneous, organic growth. It explores whether centralized planning contributes to or detracts from organic bottom-up grassroots movements that foster creative development in the arts. By discovering how the role of city planning fits into the growth pattern of artistic communities, this thesis attempts to break new ground in understanding how public policy contributes to—or detracts from—the evolution of artist communities.

This report explores in detail the experiences of four Midwestern cities, Detroit, Michigan, Grand Rapids, Michigan, Chicago, Illinois, and Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania with the emergence and development of artistic neighborhoods. The four cities selected all share social, cultural, and economic commonalities. While these cities have similar attributes that make them post-industrial urban centers, they all have distinct artistic communities that have all emerged in different ways, and all have different relationships with urban planning and renewal. Among the questions it considers is how much the development of modern artistic communities is the result of efforts to encourage young professionals and suburban “creative types” to move to cities in an act of urban renewal. The project also explores how much of this artistic community growth is due to the socio-economic conditions of the neighborhoods that attract creative types to come together in an organic migration process free of noticeable city planning and direct city involvement. Similarly, I will explore how these efforts contribute to and detract from the sustainability of neighborhoods.

The research methodology consists of intensive case-study investigations, supported by site visits, to the four cities in the Midwest. All of the site visits except Chicago required out-of-town data-collection trips lasting one or two-night stays. Interviews were conducted with approximately five individuals, consultants, city planners, and community leaders in each city. The project adhered to a tight timeline. Arrangements for site visits were completed in the late-summer, and early fall months of 2011. The Chaddick Institute for Metropolitan Development was a valuable resource for setting up
interviews with community and governmental contacts. The author’s personal contacts in Detroit and Grand Rapids, who are affiliated with local governments and community leaders, also were instrumental in arranging site visits and interviews.

Information about Transportation is another source of data that aids in understanding the emergence of artistic communities and their relationships with urban renewal. The study includes an analysis of transportation in recognition of the fact that creative communities tend to heavily rely on public transportation, and active transportation such as bicycling, and walking. Such analysis help assess how community development is linked to recent trends in the use of public transportation, including bus services, light-rail trains, and city bike lanes and bike racks, and whether such “active transportation” spur artisans to move to artist neighborhoods. This research approach is designed to help planners understand how demographic issues affect decisions to support the creation of artistic communities by city governments.
CHAPTER 2:  
BACKGROUND

Artistic communities have historically played a crucial role in the cultural development of cities. The cultivation of artistic movements over the past century has spurred both urban growth and, in some cases, has even influenced the way cities engage in urban planning. From movements such as the Harlem Renaissance and the Chicago Literary Renaissance in the first half of the 20th Century to current movements of today such as the Portland Artistic Renaissance and the Brooklyn Renaissance, artistic communities play a key role in urban development.

Writing on the history of Chicago, there is abundant literature on the history of artist communities. The Chicago Literary Renaissance brought the world to Chicago and Chicago to the world (Rotella 2005, 1). Carlo Rotella (2005, 1) stated, “The literary community of the early 20th century brought not only other artists to Chicago, but Chicago writers opened up Chicago to the world and spurred furious growth and made Chicago culturally significant.” Elizabeth Currid (2007, 456) made similar observations about Eastern American cities noting that, “Art is a driving force for New York, and the collaboration between groups caused by art and the creative process has been a historic catalyst in the progression of New York City.”

The entrepreneurial, pioneering spirit of artisans is widely believed to have helped shape local economies and communities. Many questions remain unanswered, however, about their creation and sometimes their decline. Artistic communities tend to be forerunners in using creative designs and progressive ideas to shape urban areas that are usually non-commercially viable and ignored by general society into vibrant places of social interaction and commerce. In recent years, shifts in the global
ARTISTIC IMPACT ON NEW URBANISM IN NEW YORK CITY

New York City has seen a mix of city initiative as well as spontaneous creative endeavors over the past few years in efforts intended to involve art in community building and to enhance the level of social interaction. In 2008, the New York Department of Transportation, in an attempt to increase the use of bicycles in the city, hired New York musician/artist David Byrne to design custom bike racks that would be placed in different neighborhoods of the city (Kaminer 2008). Proponents believed that aesthetically pleasing bike racks would be more easily noticeable and would hopefully encourage more people to travel around New York on bike. The city also used art as a way to advance the principles of New Urbanism by raising the profile of bicycle transportation. New Urbanism promotes the creation and restoration of diverse, walkable, compact, vibrant, mixed-use communities composed of the same components as conventional development, but assembled in a more integrated fashion, in the form of complete communities that resemble urban living before the rise of automobiles. Art has been used in New Urbanism planning projects as a tool to aid in redeveloping urban communities. The project was generally well received, and helped add to the cultural presence and sense of community in New York (Kaminer 2008).

Another notable project merging art and community in New York was launched in 2008. David Byrne, acting both on his own behalf and with support from the public-art organization, Creative Time, turned a former ferry terminal that sat desolate for half a century into an instrument (Kennedy 2008). Bryne, using a pump organ located in the center of the large empty building, made the structure into a “living” instrument. He replaced the inside of the organ with relays, switches, and controls that are
connected to blue air tubes that run throughout the building. Thus, striking one key may sound a horn, or turn on a fan, or open and close a door. The idea was to use what was existed in the empty building to make music and re-use the dormant structure. The project was a huge success and “playing the building” started having hours available Monday-Sunday for anyone to come in and sit at the organ and “play” (Kennedy 2008). This project was finished without government involvement, yet also is focused on New Urbanist ideas and has played a role in bringing people together around art to better understand the community at large.

ARTISTIC IMPACT ON COMMUNITY REDEVELOPMENT IN PADUCAH

The artistic movement in Paducah, Kentucky, a relatively small community west of Louisville, is a notable example of an emerging artistic community impacting community development. Artists from all over the country, including Washington D.C., San Francisco, and New York City, have come to Paducah to create artistic works in the community (Brundige 2006). The city started an incentive program to bring in artists to help build and re-shape some of Paducah's blighted communities and give the city as a whole a cultural identity that will bring people together and help stimulate the local economy (Brundige 2006). More than 70 artists have come to Paducah and have helped to re-design the Lowertown area, which is Paducah's oldest and most troubled community.

The artist relocation program was designed to give artists a residence and pay for their housing as well as give them a grant to help fund their projects and allow for a living stipend. The program came into being as crime and drug problems increased in Paducah and residents searched for a way to aesthetically brighten up their communities and together create an artist incentive program to help clean up and strengthen their neighborhoods.

Another incentive used in Paducah is a home ownership based program. This incentive was
created to allow artists the opportunity to purchase homes with no down payment and a very low interest loan for the full cost of buying and restoring the property. These incentives were designed to allow artists to create and carry out their art projects from their own homes, as many artists tend to live in rental house or apartments (Brundige 2006). While the artistic community has thrived in response to the recognized need for change among residents, Paducah has few parallels in the Midwest.

ARTISTIC IMPACT ON URBAN RENEWAL IN THE RUSTBELT

Cities of the Midwest have also used art to stimulate their economies. Over the past century, many Midwestern and so-called Rustbelt cities have relied on an economic backbone in industry. Many so-called Rustbelt cities have grappled with industrial decline over the past couple decades. Chicago, Milwaukee, Detroit, and Pittsburgh, for example were all among the country's leaders in industry. Now, in the early 21st Century, many of those industrial jobs have been relocated overseas in an ever globalizing world. Along with a downturn of the shrinking industrial economies, has come a shrinking middleclass in these cities, leaving thousands of abandoned buildings, rising crime rates, declining urban population, rising unemployment, and shrinking neighborhoods.

Many post-industrial Rustbelt cities have seen an emergent rise in artistic communities and are looking to the creative arts as a way to try and fill post-industrial social and economic gaps. Each city has different and distinct emerging artistic communities and movements that are helping to culturally re-define them. To help understand the current situation of artistic neighborhoods in these locales, it is important to analyze how these communities came into being, what are the different movements, and what the motivators to their creation were.

One post-industrial city that is seeing an unexpected artistic movement arise is Grand Rapids, Michigan. This city of roughly 200,000, once mostly known for its furniture industry, and most
recently, the Amway Corporation, faces enormous economic problems. Something unique occurred in Grand Rapids a few years ago however that has brought it attention and accolades: artists from all over the country (and as well as Europe and Asia) have come to take part in the Grand Rapids ArtPrize competition.

Beginning in 2009, Grand Rapids has conducted an annual ArtPrize competition which has grown to become the largest competition of its kind in the world, and it has the largest prize purse in the world at $250,000. More than 1,000 entrants put their pieces of art on display in 159 locations throughout the city (Maynard 2009). The competition runs for just under three weeks, at which time voters can go to ArtPrize's website and vote once a week for their favorite piece. At the end of the competition, a winner received $250,000. The other top 10 finalists also receive cash prizes and the total purse for the event is $500,000 (Maynard 2009).

The idea for the program came from Grand Rapids native and local business entrepreneur Rick DeVos (Maynard 2009). DeVos is a member of the DeVos family that runs the Amway Corporation. His father, Dick DeVos, ran unsuccessfully for governor of Michigan in 2006. DeVos created the community based arts event to raise the profile of Grand Rapids and boost the local economy. ArtPrize was started without government funding and now, after completing two successful years of art prizes, has started to enlist corporate sponsorship, it intends to remain a privately run event, and is registered as a nonprofit now.

The result of ArtPrize has many people looking to Grand Rapids as an emerging leader in artistic collaboration with city communities to spur economic development and sustainable growth. The first ArtPrize event in 2009 drew an estimated 200,000 people to the community, including visitors from other continents. The local economy saw a very strong boost from this activity. ArtPrize 2010 was even larger in size than the first event (Stryker 2010). The 2010 ArtPrize saw more than 1,700 artists from 21 countries display art across the city, an increase of 36% of artists and 21% in venues
used to display art pieces (Stryker 2010). The creative energy spawned by ArtPrize has captured attention elsewhere in the country as well as in Europe and East Asia. It is continuing to grow organically, within 10-15 years, it seeks to create a sustainable artistic movement that changes the culture of Grand Rapids and ultimately puts art at the top of the city's 21st Century identity. Nevertheless, it remains to be seen how ArtPrize can and may influence city planning and influence the city in implementing such services as public transportation and affordable housing.

Chicago had endured the recent economic downturn better than most other cities in the Midwest. The emergence of a growing artistic community in complicated areas has helped its economy. Over the past decade, the Wicker Park neighborhood went from being a place of little cultural significance in the city to the hub of nightlife, music, fashion, and art. Not only has the gritty, mostly artisan neighborhood been showing signs of gentrification, the development has also spread to the neighborhoods of Logan Square and Avondale.

Many residents of Logan Square and Avondale fall into two categories – young creative people and minorities. Logan Square has historically had a large Polish population that, because of the low living cost, has started attracting many young creative types, mostly musicians, away from the rising prices of Wicker Park. Avondale, which is located just north of Logan Square, is a mostly Mexican and Polish residential area that has also seen a large influx of students, artists, and the nightlife culture that comes with them.

The municipal government of Chicago has taken overt steps to create and sustain an artistic presence in Logan Square/Avondale. In 2010, the Chicago City Council approved a measure to use $12.5 million of public money, including $7 million from Tax Increment Financing (TIF) funds, to turn the Morris Sachs building on the border of the Logan Square and Avondale neighborhoods into the Hairpin Lofts, which would create affordable housing for artists (Isaacs 2010). The Hairpin Lofts project will create 28 apartments, with 21 of them being reserved for artists. In addition to the
affordable housing, the 8,000 square-feet second floor will become a community art center with multiple performance stages and practice areas (Isaacs 2010).

Pilsen is another neighborhood in Chicago that has a highly involved and engaged artistic community. Located just south of the downtown district, Pilsen historically had a vibrant Hispanic population. It has persevered during the economic downturn by focusing mainly on local shops and restaurants. Since much of the socioeconomic makeup of the community is working-class Hispanic families, Pilsen has become one of Chicago's cultural crown jewels making it attractive to both the rich and poor.

In recent years, however, Pilsen has seen much gentrification. Many have expressed concern that this gentrification will threaten the vibrant working-class community. Pilsen more recently has seen an emergence of an art scene, particularly among its younger residents (Gutierrez 2010). Although the art scene is nothing new to Pilsen, and the emerging artistic community is in some ways an extension of a Pilsen's longstanding culture, the pace is accelerating. The largest running open house for artists in Chicago has been located in Pilsen for over 40 years (Gutierrez 2010).

Another artistic community in the Midwest garnering press attention is located in Detroit, Michigan. Once the car producing capital of the world, the Motor City has been particularly hit hard by the recent downward economic turn. Government bailouts on GM and Chrysler have become symbolic of the desperate times that Detroit faces. While Detroit suffers from rising unemployment, a shrinking population, thousands of abandoned buildings, and residents that are losing if not already lost hope in their government, there is an interesting underground movement afoot in the arts.

Detroit has undergone massive change over the second half of the 20th Century. While the city was planned to have three million residents, it currently has a population of less than 800,000. Some parts of Detroit are considered almost uninhabitable. Thousands of abandoned structures can be found within the city limits. With the dilapidation of many homes and businesses in Detroit, the cost of living
is very low and has opened the door to artists who are seeking cheap places to live and pursue creative endeavors.

Art and music, nevertheless, have always been part of Detroit. Detroit was known as the “Paris of the Midwest” in the early 20th century. Spectacular growth in the auto industry fostered a culture of opportunity and decadence featuring theatre and fashion, aspects of Detroit life that slowly disappeared with the decline of the auto industry.

In the 1960’s and 1970’s (60s, 70s), Detroit was the home to the Motown music label, which produced dozens of top-selling artists. The “Motown sound” has always been associated with the Motor City, but as popular music paradigms shifted, so did the focus on Detroit's music scene and Motown became a relic of Detroit's past. In the 1980's, Detroit was also the home of techno and house music. Many associated the Motor City with being the original home of techno and house music as popular electronic artists such as Moby were from Detroit, but as electronic music became more popular in the 1990's it slowly migrated to bigger cities such as Chicago and New York.

The artistic community of Detroit today looks very different from the city's artistic movements of the past. Artists in Detroit are coming up with their own distinctive style which identifies them as belonging to the multicultural community (Roshana 2009). The underground art in Detroit, music and visual arts, is now coming together to create a collaborative artistic community to help bring the city together during this economic recession (Roshana 2009). The underground movement in Detroit is a multidisciplinary art movement dedicated to exploring identity, spatial relations, and systems of communication within contemporary culture (Roshana 2009).

Much of the artistic community in Detroit is helping to revive the Motor City through land re-usage and the incorporation of art with the urban landscape. The Power House Project was started by Mitch Cope and Gina Reichert, a couple living in Detroit who had the idea to buy foreclosed and abandoned properties and have them rebuilt by artists to live in (Guerra 2009). Cope and Reichert have
been recruiting artists from around the world. A key component is their desire to keep the properties “off the grid” (meaning harnessing and using their own sustainable energy to power their homes and not rely on the city or utility companies for their services), and establish a sense of new urbanism in the city. All the homes redone by the Powerhouse Project are powered with solar power and wind turbines with the idea that you could have an entire city block of artists residing in homes powered by alternative energy (Guerra 2009).

Public art is another key component. The Detroit Renaissance's Creative Corridor project, with an estimated $50 million budget, is attempting to connect pockets of activity on Detroit's Woodward Avenue and use art as a way to bring the community together (Mazzei 2008). Many consider the construction of a light rail line in the corridor to be the launchpad to improved public transportation and growth. Public art is a large part of the Creative Corridor project. Detroit Renaissance believes, for example that investing in the city to make it more aesthetically pleasing will pay off in bringing people back to Detroit to live and thus lead to a sustainable local economy where creativity is a central part of the cultural fabric (Mazzei 2008).

Detroit is starting to garner international attention for its evolving artistic character. Artists from Europe are moving to Detroit because of the artistic and creative happenings in its neighborhoods (Mazzei 2008). Danish students have even come to Detroit to shoot a documentary film about the potential of Detroit in the future and how the artistic community in the city could influence future urban planning ideas (Copenhagenize.com 2011).

One post-industrial city that is seeing large investment from the city government and urban planners in developing a sustainable artistic community is Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Pittsburgh was one of the steel producing leaders in the country, but after steel production began to decrease in the 1970’s, by the 1980’s Pittsburgh found itself in the center of the American Rustbelt. Beginning in the early 1990's, the city government of Pittsburgh recognized a need to try and re-establish the city in
order to survive the decline of industry.

For the past two decades Pittsburgh has been a city in transition trying to re-discover its identity in the wake of being a post-industrial city. In the 1990’s the city shifted its focus away from heavy industry and onto science related fields such as developing nano technologies. During this time Pittsburgh saw a sharp increase in the development of medical and hospital centers. At the same time as putting economic focus into new fields, the city also put a lot of attention into developing a downtown cultural district that would serve as the foundation to enticing young people and the creative class to move into downtown Pittsburgh to form an artistic community. Pittsburgh has seen major success from their downtown redevelopment, yet they are still in the process of re-establishing their identity as a culturally rich city.

In summary, artistic communities have historically played a vital role in the development of urban communities. In recent years numerous signs and trends show the impact of emerging artistic communities on urban renewal in post-industrial Midwestern cities. This background information is to help clarify current trends in artistic community emergence in relation to urban renewal. There is currently very little research and literature available on the formation and growth of artistic communities in post-industrial cities. This chapter highlights important information about post-industrial artistic communities and urban renewal that is needed as a foundation to better understand the review of literature on the larger topic of the relationship between artistic communities and their impact on urban redevelopment and economic growth.
CHAPTER 3: LITERATURE REVIEW

Several prominent scholars in the public policy field have researched and commented on the relationship between artistic communities and their impact on urban community development. One major theme found in relevant literature is the relationship between artistic communities and urban redevelopment as it relates to economic sustainability. Richard Lloyd (2006, 104) stated, “As the bohemian character of the community grows, it appeals not only to committed participants, but also to sporadic consumers.” Richard Florida (2002, 55) contends, “The presence and concentration of bohemians in an area creates an environment or milieu that attracts other types of talented or high human capital individuals. The presence of such human capital in turn attracts and generates innovate, technology-based industries.” Jan C. Semenza (2003, 1439-1441) wrote an article on the cross sector implication of urban planning, art, and how it relates to public health. Creating an artistic public gathering place fosters social capital and social cohesion that may reverse alienation and isolation (Semenza 2003, 1439). Elizabeth Currid (2007, 455) noted, “Artistic communities and a cultural economy are important for New York because they enable social interaction across classes which advances the social environment, which has kept New York on the front of being a global taste maker.”

Another theme in literature relevant to the research is the attempt to explain why artistic communities form in the urban neighborhoods they are located. Richard Lloyd (2006) looked at the importance of the artistic community in his study of Chicago's bohemian neighborhood Wicker Park. Wicker Park is a neighborhood that was radically re-designed by bohemian artists over many years, but largely due to the popularity of its artistic development a great deal of gentrification happened in the area and many artists were driven out of the community they had started. Lloyd (2006, 15) found,
“Artists seek out supportive communities not only to share supplies, information, and ideas, but also for solidarity as starving artists living and working together. Rapidly gentrification of Wicker Park leading to high costs of living is destroying the community and preventing future artists from participating in the local creative economy.” Currid (2007, 454-467) analyzed the artistic community and creative economy of New York. While artistic communities develop organically at some point the city government needs to get involved to protect and nurture the community to allow sustainability in the face of gentrification of an area that would raise the cost of living and end up displacing those who started the community (Currid 2007, 459).

Criticism has also surrounded artistic communities in that they are instigating agents for gentrification. Cities such as Chicago and New York have seen culturally rich, artistic heavy communities become victims of such gentrification. The question left is what kind of balance in the relationship between the communities and urban planning is needed to help sustain artistic communities while minimizing the long-term effects of transformation.

The impact of artistic communities on urban planning has also been examined by many policy scholars such as Carl Abbott, Jay Margeim, R. Elizabeth Thomas, Julian Rappaport, and Richard Lloyd. Carl Abbott and Joy Margheim (2008, 196-210) looked at the city of Portland and how the city limits have become to be defined not by what is stated on the map, but by where noticeable creative depictions, artistic communities, and displays of public artwork stop. The urban growth boundary for the city of Portland is now become defined by where artistic growth ends. The urban growth boundary regulation is now a cultural icon in the city (Abbott and Margheim 2008, 196). Abbott and Margheim (2008, 206) conclude, “Artistic interpretations have familiarized and humanized the UGB and embedded it in the consciousness of everyday life. Artists thus make the invisible more visible, and creative depictions help shape the boundaries of the city and influence the local government.”

R. Elizabeth Thomas and Julian Rappaport (1996, 317) explored how art communities can
impact social change and urban renewal and concluded, “We recognize the arts as both product and process, and include the intended and actual audiences as participants in the arts. Engagement in local arts projects is a way for communities to create their own identity and the arts serve as a means by which a society reminds itself of the stories it wants to remember.” An artist colony can be transformed from a poor to a rich neighborhood when artists and sub-culture aficionados live in poor neighborhoods of devalued real estate, because of the low rents, central locale in the city proper, and defiant cultural sense of authenticity, and bring the area true to life (Lloyd 2006, 89).

Research has also been done on the impact of art to spur public participation in communities and encourage urban residents not only to participate with others, but also engage with organizations. Francie Ostrower (2003, 1-28) wrote an article about cultural participation and noted, “The best way to expand both governmental and organizational programming to expand and create programs that strengthen artistic activities is through partnerships between cultural participants and the organization providing the service.” Cultural participation is a way of broadening, deepening, and diversifying participation by engaging more of the same types of people in different cultural activities, deepening the experiences of those already engaged, and engaging new groups of people in the community (Ostrower 2003, 9).

This connection to culture can be a connection to the arts and artistic activities as a way to bring people together to contribute to a sense of community and help facilitate partnerships with organizations and governments which then broaden and provide social services to the members of the community. For artistic impact in public participation to be successful, the goals of the participation and partnerships in the community must be clear and obtainable goals. The more community focused the goals are the easier it will be to bring people together to participate in community activities (Ostrower 2009, 16). The more ways people in a community participate in the arts, the more likely
are to engage in other activities that support community life (Christopher Walker 2003).

Another branch of the scholarly literature explores city governments’ role in incorporating the arts with both city planning and city participation. Carmen Sirianni (2007, 373-389) wrote an article on Seattle as an example of how local government can function as civic enablers and builders for collaborative planning between neighborhood stakeholders and the city government. Sirianni (2007, 373-389) analyzed how the Seattle city government looked to the arts as a tool to bridge interaction between neighborhood residents and the city government and how the arts also served as a catalyst in helping engage residents in collaborative planning decisions with the city. Sirianni (2007, 376) found that, “Diverse neighborhoods such as artistic and minority communities can find common ground and make positive progress on planning to address shared citywide concerns.” Sirianni (2007, 380) also noted, “Communities need staff assistance to collaborative on city planning. Neighborhood community planners can play this role, but only if the city funds them and in order to have collaborative planning the city needs to make it a priority.”

In summary the literature brings attention to the many variables involved in the creation and continuation of artistic communities. It is important to note currently there is no major research on the topic of the impact of artistic communities on urban renewal in post-industrial cities. While this lack of current research is noticeable, there are themes from research in other areas of artistic communities and urban planning that is relevant to this research. Community involvement, transportation, economic development, and social environment are just some of the elements that determine the ability of artistic communities to proper in urban areas. Although the government's role differs from community to community, many questions remain about tradeoffs between planning and citizen spontaneity. There is much to be learned by further exploring the relationship between local governments and artistic communities.
CHAPTER 4:
METHODOLOGY

The methodology mostly consists of qualitative research conducted over the late summer and fall of 2011. The emphasis on qualitative tools were due to the difficulty of measuring the qualities of artistic communities. There are so many different factors involved in the creation, emergence, and sustainability of artistic communities that first we need to understand how these communities are formed before we can try to measure any kind of impact. As a result, the research was designed to gain insight into the attitudes, behaviors, concerns, motivations, cultures, and lifestyles of the active participants in artistic communities.

The focus of this research methodology lies in gathering information in the field through immersion in the cultures and artistic communities of each city studied. The field research favored a bottom-up approach with a focus on engaging artists and community leaders in answering the research question, namely what is the impact of emerging artistic communities on urban renewal in post-industrial cities? The reason for the bottom-up focus in the methodology is to understand whether an artistic community is the result of a planned initiative or if it spontaneously emerged due to grassroots action in the right environmental conditions. Another reason for a bottom-up focus is most planners and government officials do not live in the artistic communities which concern them. To understand the needs of the artistic community is to focus on the perspective of individuals who live in these communities, and in this case the artists. For the purpose of this research, the perspective of those who engage, live, and participate in artistic communities is more crucial than higher level policy makers.

This research is designed to help planners and city governments understand what kind of policies and planning will help in cultivating artistic communities in post-industrial Midwestern cities.
The perspective of those who are actively engaged in artistic communities and working on the ground level in community redevelopment is the data that this research aims to give city planners and governments so they have a greater insight into these emerging artistic communities. To maximize the implementation of effective policies in Midwestern post-industrial cities that benefit artistic communities, urban planners and city governments need to have knowledge of what factors caused the formation and growth of artistic communities in similar post-industrial cities.

There was a vetting process of visiting different post-industrial cities over the summer. I selected cities for intensive case studies based on preliminary field visits looking at different attributes and characteristics of each city. One important criterion is for each city to have signs of a thriving artistic community that included street art, underground music and performance art venues, neighborhoods with large influence from artists and creative types, and a noticeable engagement in the community by artists to impact urban renewal. Another significant attribute for selection is the designation as a Midwestern Rustbelt city that has faced a loss of industry due to an economic downturn, and is now considered a post-industrial city. The final selection criterion was an ample number of prospective contacts familiar with the artistic communities or urban planning of their respective city to interview for data collection. The cities selected for further site visits included Pittsburgh, Grand Rapids, Detroit, and Chicago. All four cities selected contained emerging artistic communities, are post-industrial cities located in the Midwestern Rustbelt, and also had numerous contacts available for interviews to gain insights and information about the artistic communities in each city.
Table 1. Details of City Selection Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Selected</th>
<th>City Not Selected</th>
<th>Emergent Artistic Communities</th>
<th>Post-Industrial City</th>
<th>Available Contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Rapids</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milwaukee</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Louis</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first set of preliminary site visits I made were during the summer months of July and August of 2011. I visited Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, on July 1-3, 2011, and observed the Cultural District as well as The Hill District and the river development on the south shore of the city. During that time I talked to Michael Brooks and had first contact with Lauren McReynolds. The next visit was to Grand Rapids, Michigan, on July 12-14, 2011, on this trip I visited the Avenue for The Arts on South Division Ave as well as talking to artists in the Eastown neighborhood. Detroit’s preliminary site visit came on July 15-16, 2011, and I visited Eastern Market as well as Midtown and talked with Kristin Michael and Patrick Guenther about their experiences with the Detroit artistic community. Living in Chicago, I met with and talked to artists in artistic communities of Logan Square, Wicker Park, and Pilsen throughout the summer, and visited various house and loft spaces converted to performance venues in both neighborhoods. After many field observations in these areas, the author felt comfortable with the amount of artistic activity and activism going on in those neighborhoods for Chicago to be part of the research.
In August 2011, preliminary site visits were made to Milwaukee, Wisconsin, and St. Louis, Missouri, but based on those visits both cities were ruled out of being in the research intensive case studies. The preliminary visit for Milwaukee took place on August 6-10, and I couldn’t find enough evidence of a large scale emergent artistic community to the level of those in Pittsburgh, Grand Rapids, and Detroit. I did not feel I had enough sufficient contacts in Milwaukee to aid in furthering research of the local artistic community in Milwaukee. The preliminary site visit to St. Louis took place on August 27-28, and the preliminary visit to St. Louis did not provide enough support or evidence of the existing artistic community to warrant further research for this specific project. Due to the nature of underground grassroots “Do It Yourself” artistic communities it was too difficult to observe and measure the activity of spontaneous artistic action going on in Milwaukee or St. Louis.

During the visits to Milwaukee and St. Louis I did not see signs of the local artistic community having a substantially noticeable impact on urban renewal. The preliminary visits to Detroit, Pittsburgh, and Grand Rapids, and field observations in Chicago did warrant further research as the artistic communities in those cities made an impact on urban renewal. Artistic impact on urban renewal is evident in the following community projects taking place in the cities selected for case studies:

Table 2. Details of Site Visits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Date of Visit</th>
<th># of Neighborhoods Visited</th>
<th>In-Person Interviews Conducted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td>Nov. 1 – 3, 2011</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh</td>
<td>Sept. 25 – 27, 2011</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>Traveled to artistic neighborhoods and artistic events in the city throughout the fall months of 2011.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DETROIT
- Power House Project in North Hamtramck
- Brightmoor Community Redevelopment
- Heidelberg Project in the McDougall-Hunt Neighborhood
- Woodward Corridor Redevelopment in Midtown

PITTSBURGH
- Cultural District in Downtown Pittsburgh
- South Shore Redevelopment
- Oakland Neighborhood Redevelopment

GRAND RAPIDS
- Avenue for the Arts on South Division Avenue in the Heartside Neighborhood
- Wealthy Street Redevelopment
- Urban Institute for Contemporary Art’s Participation in Urban Design Program

CHICAGO
- Logan Square Neighborhood Redevelopment
- Bridgeport Neighborhood Redevelopment
- Pilsen Artistic Renaissance

The site selection criteria for the neighborhoods and artistic sites studied in each city were based on the preliminary field immersion visits, preliminary research on the artistic communities of each city, and data collected from interviews and contacts regarding their experiences interacting and participating in emerging artistic communities. The neighborhoods, locations, and events researched culminated from the site selection criteria, and with the given time constraints of the research project, it is impossible to cover every aspect of the artistic communities of each city studied, and the purpose is to highlight the most effective neighborhoods and locations showcasing the impact of emerging artistic communities on urban renewal and community development.

The selection process for interview contacts in the research were based on specific criteria. The most important attribute for each resource contact is that they have an in-depth knowledge and
experience with the artistic community for which they are interviewed. The contacts also must live or have lived in the city of the artistic community they are interviewed about. Resource contacts such as Ian Williams, Michael Brooks, and Nick Trentacost not only lived in multiple cities studied in this research, but actively engaged in the artistic communities of those cities. Preference was given to contacts who were currently engaged as artists, urban planners, or community leaders in the artistic communities being researched. For the credibility of the findings of this research, it is intuitive that the contacts have an intimate knowledge of these emerging artistic communities, have actively engaged in with communities, and have experienced the impact on urban renewal these communities have caused.

The intensive case studies occurred during the fall season, and the first site visit was made to Pittsburgh. The site visit dates in Pittsburgh were from September 25-27. In that span I visited numerous neighborhoods in Pittsburgh including the Cultural District and downtown area, the Strip District, the Hill District, Oakland, Shadyside, North Shore, and South Shore featuring the river redevelopment. I visited numerous gallery spaces including the Wood Street Galleries and Future Tenant, as well as seeing Altar Bar, which is an old church redeveloped and reused as a music venue. I met with and interviewed five artists while in Pittsburgh being Michael Brooks, Maxwell Beehner, Joy Ike, Ben Huebacher, and Marissa Cinquanti. Two resources Lauren McReynolds and Ian Williams were unable to meet with me in person, but I later had telephone interviews with both of them after my site visit.

Following the site visit to Pittsburgh I traveled to Grand Rapids and attended the opening weekend of ArtPrize from September 28 – October 2. I visited many official ArtPrize venues including the Grand Rapids Art Museum, The HUB, The Bob, the Urban Institute for Contemporary Arts, and many others. While observing and researching ArtPrize I also visited the Ave for the Arts on South Division Ave in the Heartside neighborhood and visited the DAAC, Vertigo Music, and Store. The site
visit also consisted of seeing the Eastown neighborhood and recent redevelopment of Wealthy Street. I interviewed seven people while conducting the site visit in Grand Rapids including artists, community leaders, venue operators, an academic professional, and an ArtPrize planner. Those I interviewed in Grand Rapids are Noddea Skidmore, Calin Skidmore, Dr. Gary Huey, Hunter Bridwill, Chris Oposnow, Jenn Schaub, and Kyle Isbell.

The visit to Detroit, the last intensive site visit conducted for research purposes, occurred on November 1-3, 2011. During the visit I engaged with Midtown, Brightmoor, Eastern Market, McDougall-Hunt, West Detroit, Corktown, Delray, New Center, and North Hamtramck neighborhoods as well as the downtown area. I met with and interviewed five individuals while in Detroit consisting of artists, community leaders, and urban planners. The five individuals I personally interviewed while in Detroit are Kristin Michael, Patrick Guenther, Michael Poris, Lisa Rodriguez, and Stephen Barcus. I unfortunately was not able to personally meet with all my resources during my site visit and I had to conduct three phone interviews outside of my site research in Detroit. The three phone interviews I conducted were with artist Monica Canilao, musician Nick Trentacost, and community leader and non-profit worker Jeffrey Jones.

Chicago fits all the needed criteria selection as the three cities featured in intensive case studies, but the size of city and artistic community of Chicago is so vast that given the strict timeline the study had to adhere to the entire artistic community of Chicago was deemed too in-depth to cover in one chapter of this thesis. The research in this city focused on the Logan Square, Avondale, Pilsen, and Bridgeport neighborhoods. These emerging artistic communities in Chicago share common themes and characteristics with artistic communities found in the other three cities studied. Chicago having a history of being a culturally enriched city gives it an opportunity to be an example to other post-industrial cities of policies they’ve enacted to foster artistic communities. Chicago not only the largest city in the Midwest, but also the economic, social, and cultural center for the region serves as a model a
lot of other post-industrial cities would like to emulate. For the purpose of this research, by looking at emerging artistic communities in up and coming Chicago neighborhoods serves as a point of comparison and contrast to the artistic communities in Detroit, Grand Rapids, and Pittsburgh.

Although Chicago is not part of the formal case-study analysis, I spoke with artists, venue operators, and community leaders throughout the fall months in the Logan Square, Avondale, Pilsen, and Bridgeport neighborhoods. I conducted in-person interviews with numerous local artists, including Michael Brooks, Lex Reed, and Harrison Hickok. In addition, my telephone and email interviews with four individuals involved with the Chicago DIY “underground artistic community” gave me insight about their experiences in Chicago. Among those I interviewed by telephone and email include John Yingling, Trevor de Brauw, Ian Williams, and Nick Trentacost.

While most of the research methodology consists of research intensive case studies there is also an quantitative component to the analysis provided below. I analyzed population and demographic census data of each of the four cities. I examine population growth to show the effects that the loss of industry has had on the socioeconomic makeup of post-industrial cities and to show why their need for change and redevelopment is so strong. I also evaluate the population influx in certain demographic groups to show evidence of emerging artistic communities. Finally, I explore transportation as a research component for studying artistic communities. In looking at artistic communities one aspect I researched was the availability and proximity of public transportation to areas that contain artistic communities.
CHAPTER 5:
CASE STUDY 1: DETROIT

Detroit, once the automobile manufacturing giant and considered to be the “Paris of the Midwest,” faced an enormous level of decline. Midway through the 20th century, Detroit was the 4th largest populated city in America. Now, 50 years later, Detroit is not even in the top ten. Currently, Detroit is the 18th most populated U.S. City with a population of 713,777 (U.S. Census Bureau Resident Population 2010). The decrease in population has also helped to diminish Detroit’s size. The city of Detroit is currently planning to shrink the city by 25% because it can no longer support its current size of 137.75 sq miles. By ushering in a new and controversial land redevelopment involving urban agriculture, the city hopes to better utilize its best empty space (U.S. Census Detroit QuickFacts 2010). Many of the factors that led to Detroit’s economic success in the first half of the 20th century also are responsible for its decline.

To adapt to the shift in population and jobs to the surrounding suburbs, Detroit has had to adjust its role within the larger metropolitan area. In recent years, downtown Detroit has seen an increased role as an entertainment hub with the opening of three casinos, Comerica Park (the new home of the Detroit Tigers), Ford Field (the new home of the Detroit Lions who previously played in Pontiac, Michigan), and a revitalized riverfront. The metropolitan region of Detroit currently holds roughly one-half of the state's population (U.S. Census Bureau Metropolitan Population 2010).

Detroit has one of the most exciting artistic communities in America, but its development took some time. Detroit is currently filled with young creative pioneers experimenting in the arts as well as urban and architectural design in neighborhoods across the city. This was evident in an interview with Jeffrey Jones, a community leader with the non-profit organization Next Detroit, which focuses on revitalizing community development in impoverished neighborhoods as well as working as an
community activist with the group Community Public Arts Detroit. Jones (2011) explained, “There has been a lot of new attention to development in Detroit and it has to do with the arts. Many here are excited though some are still cynical of Detroit recovering because of the practices that got Detroit where it is.” Michael Poris (2011), who sits on the board of directors for the Heidelberg Project as well as being a principal architect at McIntosh Poris Associates said, “There is a resurgence of art happening in Detroit, but it won't stay if communities can't come together.” Detroit is in a position to poise itself to be a modern city full of new urbanism practices alongside a growing grassroots artistic movement, but first it must overcome economic, social, and racial issues from the post-industrial fallout that are still bogging down the city and keeping it from reorganizing in the early 21st century.

Figure 1.

Schematics of Notable Artistic Neighborhoods in Detroit, Michigan.
View of Community Garden Located at the Heidelberg Project.

Tyree Guyton’s Mother’s House, which was the first house Tyree redesigned as part of the Heidelberg Project.
An abandoned Home in Southwestern Detroit Near the Delray Neighborhood. This was one of almost a dozen homes that were abandoned or foreclosed just on one side of the street.

The Inside of Transmat Art Gallery Located in Eastern Market on Gratiot Avenue.
Up-close view of a Piece of Street Art Found on an Abandoned Building
in Midtown on Woodward Avenue.
Nighttime view of the Dormer House, which is one of the homes featured in the Power House Project.

HISTORY

Detroit became a boom town in the late 1910's and 1920's mostly due to the effect of the automobile industry that was built in the city. The location of Detroit was strategic due to its proximity to the Great Lakes for shipping, and the big three American automakers of Ford, General Motors, and Chrysler all settled down in Detroit. Henry Ford's revolutionary idea for the assembly line not only changed the way that cars were made but also drastically changed the city of Detroit. The boom of industry from automobiles and the ability to hire thousands of workers led families from across the country to the newly emerging industrial mecca of Detroit.

The 1920's brought unprecedented growth and made Detroit one of the largest cities in the U.S. Development was very different than in others major U.S. cities. Detroit has extensive residential neighborhoods and, outside of the downtown area, very few apartment buildings. Detroit is very large
in terms of land area and the vastness of residential neighborhoods makes the city seem even larger than it is. One reason was that Henry Ford. Ford was determined to have his workers focus on having and raising families in single-family homes. The Ford Motor Company built and created many residential neighborhoods to house workers in northern and western Detroit (Jones 2011). Ford also believed in the idea of auto-workers driving cars they made themselves, and having a large number of residential neighborhoods sprawled out through the city caused the need for the use of a car since no public transit was available when these neighborhoods were created (Poris 2011).

Housing and population were not the only things that boomed in Detroit in the early 20th century. Detroit became a hotbed for culture and much of that was due to the diverse groups of people who moved to Detroit for work. Detroit had a premiere opera and philharmonic orchestra and Midtown became known for its raucous jazz clubs and wild nightlife (Poris 2011).

African-American culture had a very vibrant impact on Detroit and the artistic community within the city. African-American cultural influence in Detroit was most prevalent during the 1960's and 70's when Motown Records and Motown artists such as The Supremes, Smokey Robinson and The Temptations, Stevie Wonder and others dominated the Billboard charts.

Detroit was prosperous throughout the mid-century and into the 1960's. Gary Huey, a history professor at Ferris State University and is an expert on the history of Michigan. Huey (2011) notes that, “Detroit became known as the arsenal for the allies during World War II because of the industry in the city that produced weapons and vehicles for the ally war effort.” After World War II, Detroit saw another large boom in housing and automobile demand was at an all-time high since cars weren't made during World War II (Huey 2011). Detroit, due to some poor planning choices, did not have as long of a prosperous socioeconomic boom period as they imagined. Detroit in the early 20th century had a trolley railcar public transportation system that was removed in favor for more rooms for automobiles.
In the 1950's Detroit build a massive highway system around the city which was good for auto manufacturers, but gave way to urban sprawl and was the start of the exodus for many out of Detroit (Jones 2011).

Detroit’s decline began in the 1960's. Huey (2011) stated, “Racial tensions rose in the 1960's and Detroit experienced city-wide riots that ushered in a new era in Detroit's history as a racially divided decaying metropolis that just couldn't last.” Most upper-class and many middle-class families left Detroit after the riots and moved to the suburbs. This left a large income disparity between the white, upper-middle class of the surroundings suburbs and the working and middle class of mostly African-Americans that remained in Detroit proper (Jones 2011). Then, following the racial tensions of the 1960's, Detroit was hit hard by a car industry downturn by American car manufacturing with the importation of smaller, more fuel-efficient Asian and European cars into the American market.

More people left Detroit to try and find industry work elsewhere and unemployment rates, coupled with abandoned buildings, started to rise. Many hoped Detroit could bounce back in the 1980's but it never regained economic stability and by the end of the decade thousands of jobs were lost. Hard times continued to grip Detroit throughout the 1990's and 2000's with sustained job loss, home foreclosures, building abandonment, racial divide, and numerous political scandals. Detroit was already far into a recession before the U.S. economy took a nose dive in the late 2000's.

Detroit's first wave of underground art movements began in the 1980's. In the mid 1980's, Detroit became the epicenter for the burgeoning electronic music scene. Many empty warehouses became vibrant on weekend nights for raves (DJ hosted dance parties) (Guenther 2011). While Detroit as a whole was home to an underground electronic music movement, another artistic movement started in the lower-east side of the city.

One of the most important spontaneous artistic movements that has occurred in recent Detroit history is the Heidelberg Project. The Heidelberg Project is an outdoor art project in the McDougall-
Hunt neighborhood on Detroit's east side. The Heidelberg Project is the brainchild of Detroit artist Tyree Guyton who started the project on the block where he grew up as a child (Rodriquez 2011). Lisa Rodriquez (2011), a guest artist and curator of the Heidelberg Project, explained, “Tyree went into the army and upon leaving the service came home and couldn't believe the state of his neighborhood. He wanted to clean up his neighborhood and deter the crime and drug activities that were going on at the time. Tyree started with his mother's house and painted it with polka dots, and then continued to paint both abandoned and occupied houses on the block to make them living art installations.” Guyton started the Project in 1986 and it continues to this day to receive many visitors and media attention.

The Heidelberg Project is focused on redeveloping the McDougall-Hunt neighborhood and puts a focus on urban design. Jeffrey Jones (2011) commented, “The Heidelberg Project has put an emphasis on art as it relates to design. Guyton has taken empty homes that many attributed to the blight and decay of Detroit, and made them into community interactive art pieces.” The project has run into resistance by the city government in the past and Guyton has operated on a grassroots level in moving forward the goals of the project. On two separate occasions the city has ordered the demolition of Heidelberg Project houses on the basis of the barriers to urban planning the project represented (Moore 1999). The Heidelberg Project is a good example of combing art with design to redevelop neighborhoods into communities that can better serve its residents on a grassroots level.

POLICY ISSUES

The city faces enormous challenges on a multitude of levels. Detroit has suffered one of the worst economic downturns of any post-industrial city, and with those troubles come a plethora of issues dealing with social cohesion along with housing and development concerns. While many of the problems Detroit needs to solve deal with economic and social policy, problems pertaining to the city's
urban planning, community development, and the artistic community abound.

A lack of jobs and decaying homes and commercial buildings along with the mounting concerns of crime and drugs have caused hundreds of thousands of people to move out of Detroit. The city’s population in 2000 was 951,270 and the 2010 census put Detroit's current population at 713,777 which is a population decrease of 25% in only ten years (U.S. Census Bureau Detroit QuickFacts 2010). The city has the policy issue of trying to sustain Detroit's current population at the very least but also attempt to bring new people to Detroit in the hopes of creating new jobs and stirring innovation. The mass exodus out of Detroit has caused a huge problem with the amount of empty and abandoned structures currently left in the city.

A policy issue the city of Detroit is trying to deal with is redevelopment of the incredibly large amount of abandoned buildings and properties there currently are within the city limits. Between residential and commercial buildings, there is an estimated 100,000 empty structures within the city limits of Detroit (Poris 2011). Much of the commercial building abandonment is caused by the industrial exodus out of Detroit, which did not see new kinds of industry move in to empty factories and industrial buildings that have been abandonment for many years. The high unemployment rate with lack of job creation within the city and decreasing property values caused many homeowners to lose their property through bank foreclosures and property condemning done by the city. The vast number of abandoned structures has forced the city to acquire most of the empty properties.

The city now has the policy issue of how to redevelop all the land they acquired and how to turn the properties back over to business and home owners. The city is in such financial peril that it cannot keep up with property maintenance on much of the properties in the city. Kristin Michael (2011), a Detroit native who received her master’s in urban design and regional planning from the University of Pennsylvania, commented, “Western Detroit hit hardest by foreclosures and loss of industry, has been nicknamed the “Wild West of the Midwest” due to the rough urban terrain and desolate living
conditions. Western areas of Detroit badly need redevelopment to have any chance to revitalize the community.”

Many neighborhoods in Detroit are seeing decreasing populations as crime rates, gang activity, and drug use increases. Patrick Guenther (2011), a Detroit native who is a documentary filmmaker, visual artist and community leader with the group Food in the Hood, commented, “There is a lot of mistrust between the people of Detroit and city hall. Many efforts by the city to rebuild communities have failed in the early stages because many people have given up on the city with matters on a neighborhood level.” The city needs to find a way to revitalize communities and reintroduce development, but without the money to redevelop all the areas of the city that need it or businesses moving to Detroit and creating jobs, there is a large problem that exists with how to improve communities on limited resources.

The established artistic community has been hit hard by the economic downturn and lack of available governmental resources. Lisa Rodriquez (2011), who is the current resident guest artist and curator of the Heidelberg Project, told me, “We (Heidelberg Project) get nothing from the city, we are totally dependent on donations from individuals and organizations to survive.” Nick Trentacost (2011), a musician and DIY show promoter who is from and currently lives in Detroit, stated, “Detroit is transitioning to become a younger person artistic community, but in order to do that successfully, Detroit needs jobs.” Yet with all the policy issues and concerns that Detroit has, many people do have hope for Detroit and much of that hope comes from the organically emerging artistic community that is moving from the underground to the forefront of the city.

**FINDINGS**

Detroit, for all its struggles and turmoil, like no other post-industrial city, has in recent years
finally started to see a transition occur to lead it out of the doldrums of industrial waste into a new city. One of the key factors in the transitional phase of “New Detroit” is the artistic community and its impact on the culture and neighborhood communities. Where much of the fallout of lost industry has created a deep burden on the city and people of Detroit, it has given rise to the emergence of an underground artistic community built on the ethics of Do It Yourself. The attitude in Detroit is starting to change and be galvanized by the work and effort of mostly young artists who are being active in cultivating a new Detroit not based on the auto industry, but on the arts, agriculture, and experimental design.

For many, the current state of Detroit is not an ideal place to live, but for some, the low cost of living combined with the lack of city government involvement in much of the neighborhood communities is exactly what artistic newcomers are looking for. Artists have been the pioneers of the new Detroit, and they are taking destabilized neighborhoods and trying to create sustainable, vibrant communities by the use of artistic activism. No one could have predicted the influx of artists to Detroit, and a result has generated some much needed positive attention.

Artists can thrive in impoverished communities where costs and quality of life can be rather low. In the past few years, there has been a growing movement to revitalize and rebuild Detroit started by young people who are attempting to redesign the city with the arts. In 2010, for the first time in forty years, the white population (though minimal) has seen an increase (U.S. Census Bureau Metropolitan Population 2010). Much of the influx of people moving to Detroit is compromised of young people seeking to create communities on their own terms, and many of them are artists who are inspired by the devastated landscape of the city (Michael 2011). Jeffrey Jones (2011) of the non-profit community rebuilding organization Next Detroit explained, “Communities are reinventing themselves with the artistic sub-culture going on in Detroit, specifically neighborhoods like Brightmoor, Northend, North Hamtramck, and along Woodward Ave.” Jones (2011) went on to say, “Young people are now looking
to move into neighborhoods in Detroit and live an alternative lifestyle they can't get anywhere else.”

In Pittsburgh and Grand Rapids, artistic communities have mostly emerged in the downtown areas. In smaller cities, the downtown areas are however most capable of supporting and creating sustainable artistic communities. In Detroit, artistic communities are forming in areas outside of the downtown including conventional residential neighborhoods as well as in commercial districts and city-established cultural districts.

One of the most notable grassroots artistic developments in Detroit is the Power House Project. Taking place in northeast Detroit, north of the Hamtramck in the neighborhood of Krainz Woods, it is the creation of Mitch Cope and Gina Reichert. The project, started in 2009, seeks to support the work of artists in the neighborhood. Creating a socially interactive experience, the Power House Project attempts to inject creativity and inspiration into the community and help turn it around through the power of the arts (Jaworski 2011).

The Power House Project has become so successful it is now a registered 501(c)3 non-profit organization called Power House Productions. PHP is seeking neighborhood revitalization and stabilization through the arts and creative processes. PHP has expanded from the first Power House to include numerous houses in the neighborhood north of Hamtramck and they now have an artist residence program (Power House Productions 2010). The artists working with PHP are true pioneers and are progressively improving the neighborhood and building a grassroots community. Many of the houses being used by PHP are foreclosed homes that are in need of major repairs, many have been purchased homes at only nominal prices. The first home, for example, was bought for only $1,900 (Jaworski 2011). One of the current resident artists, Monica Canilao (2011) from Oakland, California, described the Power House Project as, “Not easy living conditions. The house I stayed in is all pirated water and electricity with no internet. I had to use my phone to deal with emails and using the internet.
Many of the homes that are part of the project need interior work to be habitable.” The low cost of living in the neighborhood allows it to be a great environment to cultivate an artistic community.

The actions of the Power House Project and Power House Productions have spawned experiments in housing design and how to influence the redevelopment of residential areas through the arts. With the artist residency program, artists from across the country and abroad can move into a house owned by the project and are allowed to creatively redesign the homes as a means of artistic expression and experimental design (Power House Productions 2011). Many of the guest artists have taken uniquely different approaches to redesigning homes in the neighborhood.

Nearby in the North Hamtramck neighborhood, a similar organization is working to engage the neighborhood and general public by combining arts with urban design. DFLUX is a group of DIY artists home-owners who specifically bought up cheap homes in the No Ham (North Hamtramck) neighborhood with the goal of turning them into modern architectural experiments (Cox 2010). DFLUX is working with the community to redesign unusable homes in the neighborhoods into livable homes and are using the arts as a way to cultivate positive change in the community (Michael 2011). Charlie O'Green is part of the DFLUX group and he bought a home for $1,100 which he is using as an opportunity to experiment in architecture. O’Green anchored his house onto piers and its float above the ground. The cheap price of homes is allowing people to take risks and experiment with design and architecture in redesigning the homes. The lack of central communities in many neighborhoods is allowing artists to redesign the homes within them to their own vision of artistically infused modern neighborhoods.

Another neighborhood seeing an emergence of a grassroots artistic community is Eastern Market in eastern Detroit, which it has two different underground artistic movements underway on Gratiot Avenue. Artist Derek May's Transmat art gallery and the home base for musician and artist Stephen Barcus, who runs the independent music festival Scrummage Fest. Derek May is a lifelong
Detroit resident who became interested in the underground Detroit music scene as his career started as a musician making underground electronic music (Guenther 2011). May is now focused on visual art and currently has an art gallery called Transmat in Eastern Market. The building Transmat is in was formerly a warehouse building that May has converted into a gallery art space for the public to enjoy.

Stephen Barcus lives a block away from the Transmat Gallery and is very familiar with the underground artistic movements sweeping Detroit. Barcus is originally from the suburbs of Detroit and moved into the city to pursue the arts. Barcus started hosting music performances at his loft space on Gratiot Ave six years ago, which he called Scrummage University. Barcus (2011) explained, “I originally started booking shows with bands where I lived because there weren't a lot of places to book bands who played original music. The shows did really well and we gained a reputation as an art space that would let bands do things they couldn't do anywhere else.” Eventually Scrummage University got to the point where we were hosting art installations and non-musical events as well and the shows became too large for the loft space. It then evolved into a summer festival called Scrummage Fest held at various warehouses throughout the city as well events at the loft space (Barcus 2011). The Scrummage events have been very successful despite being operated and maintained at a grassroots level.

Still another neighborhood being redefined by the arts and an emerging artistic community is Brightmoo, on the northwest side. Jeffrey Jones is working with Next Detroit in the community of Brightmoor to revitalize the community using the arts and urban agriculture. Jones (2011) explains, “Brightmoor was designed to be affordable residential housing, but many of the houses were affordable because they were of lesser quality than other homes. The neighborhood saw racial tensions in the 60's and 70's following by mass exodus of families due to the demise of the auto industry. The community gained the nickname 'Blightmoor' and in the past few decades has been victim to gang violence,
vandalism, and drug activities.”

An artistic renaissance has brought new hope to Brightmoor. Jones (2011) commented, “With the exodus of people out of the community you have to recognize who the market is to live in a community like Brightmoor and need to support those people in rebuilding the community. In the case of Brightmoor, people who have been revitalizing the community are artists who like being in Brightmoor and living an alternative lifestyle.” When walking around Brightmoor there are public art projects on almost every block. The neighborhood has seen artists like Johannes Mattheisson move into the area for the purpose of reinventing the community through the arts and public participation. Residents in the community are active in rebuilding Brightmoor and now you can see artists moving into empty storefronts with the appearance of an artistic sub-culture (Jones 2011). While there still quite a few empty homes and buildings in Brightmoor, there is a feeling of hope for the future in the community. This decaying neighborhood is using the arts as a way to bring a community together.

The experiences of Brightmoor, which has seen much to the spontaneous artistic activity, differ sharply from those along Woodward Avenue in Midtown, which fits the model of a planned artistic community. Michael Poris (2011) explained, “Woodward in Midtown was the site of the Detroit jazz scene in the early 20th century and there's a lot of history there. In the wake of redevelopment happening in the downtown area, you are seeing a lot of gentrification focus in the Midtown area.” Kristin Michael (2011) notes, “Woodward Avenue is also slated for a light-rail line and is an important corridor for Wayne State University.

It makes a lot of sense to try and entice artists into that area because of the young student population and the proximity to the new and much needed train system.” There are loft housing and coffee shops being put in along Woodward where empty storefronts and buildings previously stood for years (Poris 2011). Woodward Avenue in Midtown is bustling because of the university and hospital system located in the area, and it has a very safe and social feel compared to most of Detroit outside of
the downtown area. The redevelopment of Woodward Avenue seems closer to what you would find in Pittsburgh or Wealthy Street in Grand Rapids than the rest of Detroit proper.

Several conclusions, can be drawn about Detroit’s experience. 1. While there are elements of planned development to allow for an artistic community to develop in areas like Midtown and the Downtown area, most of Detroit is experiencing an unprecedented organically founded grassroots artistic movement in the post-industrial hub. 2. Low property values and decentralized neighborhoods have enticed artists to move into the city and forge their artistic and social ideas into reinventing neighborhoods with experimental home designs, public interactive art installations, and creating communities with artistic visions. 3. Many economic and social factors that can impact the long-term sustainability and cultural influence of the spontaneously emerging artistic community in Detroit.

Communities redeveloped and reinvented by young artists have given the people of Detroit something the city hasn't had in decades, hope.
CHAPTER 6:

CASE STUDY 2: GRAND RAPIDS

Grand Rapids, Michigan, became home to many Scandinavian and Northern European immigrants throughout the 19th and early 20th century, and Grand Rapids is best known for the furniture that is built there. Most of the city’s culture stems from the large Dutch, Scandinavian, and Polish communities that have settled down in the area (Huey 2011).

Grand Rapids, the second largest city in Michigan, is much different from Detroit. It has been relatively successful at a time when much of the state has been in economic crisis. The city has suffered from the economic downtown, as much the city was built, on which is now a fading furniture industry. Grand Rapids has 21.9% of its population in poverty, which is higher than the state average of 14.5% (U.S. Census Bureau Grand Rapids Quickfacts 2010), but much lower than Detroit. Grand Rapids has also seen only a small decline in population the past decade of 4.9%, but that is the smallest percentage of population decline of any major post-industrial Midwestern city. Even with the slow decline of the furniture and auto industry in Grand Rapids, the city has remained economically viable (U.S. Census Bureau Grand Rapids Quickfacts 2010).

Besides having a large furniture industry, Grand Rapids is also home to the Amway Corporation, which has been both a blessing and curse on the city. Amway, in various indirect ways, has been crucial to the newly emerging artistic community in Grand Rapids brought on by the ArtPrize revolution. While there has been much controversy and criticism surrounding Amway and their business practices, the corporation has been an economic success and a strong philanthropic partner to the city of Grand Rapids. Much like Pittsburgh, the city has a strong connection to philanthropic giving and supports its artistic community.
Figure 2.

Schematics of the Neighborhoods in Grand Rapids, Michigan, Featuring Sites of Artistic Activity.

Map created by William Covert; not to scale.
ArtPrize venue located in an empty building nearby the UICA and hosted by the University of Michigan’s Urban Design Program.

View of the crowded ArtPrize opening weekend festivities in downtown Grand Rapids, with a sculpture by Alexander Calder in the background.
Downtown Grand Rapids was packed with people on Saturday afternoon during the opening weekend of ArtPrize.

The DAAC located on South Division Avenue, barely resembles an arts venue with an old restaurant marquee overlooking the storefront DIY space.
Metaphorest, a Top Ten Finalist in the 2011 ArtPrize, resides on the side of a building and is one of the larger ArtPrize entrees in 2011.

HISTORY

While Grand Rapids does not have the lush cultural history and artistic diversity as Chicago, Detroit, and other post-industrial cities, it does have a fledgling artistic community. Its artistic community has historically been centralized in the neighborhood of East Town. The artistic community in East Town dates back to the 1960s.

Longtime Grand Rapids resident and local stage actor Calin Skidmore (2011) recalled the history of this neighborhood in an interview. East Town has always been home to a lot of working-class families and served as a middle-class to lower-middle class neighborhood (Skidmore 2011). This area, as it became a hub for working-class families, attracted bohemians and artists as well. Calin (2011)
stated, “In the 1960's, East Town gained a reputation for containing many so-called 'hippies' and bohemians, and that is still the reputation it has today.” The gem for many years in East Town was Wealthy Street Theater.

Wealthy Street Theater was the pride of the Wealthy Street area city for many years until it closed down in 1970 (the theater later re-opened in 1999) due to the economic hard times that fell upon the theater and much of Wealthy Street (Huey 2011). The commercial strip of Wealthy Street fell onto hard times as commerce dispersed to other parts of the city and the area became poverty stricken and crime ridden.

If the neighborhood of East Town is known for its “creative class,” Grand Rapids as a whole is known for its community theater and visual arts. The Urban Institute for Contemporary Arts (UICA) located in downtown Grand Rapids, formed in 1977 by a group of artists, is a non-profit organization with a mission to create a venue for challenging new forms of artistic expression (Urban Institute for Contemporary Arts 2011). The UICA is home to Michigan's largest contemporary arts center, and it features performances, educational workshops, and community events involving visual arts, music, dance, film, literature, and performance art. The arts organization has continued to grow larger in scope, membership, and attention over the past 30 years. The UICA has grown to become a central and integral component of the Grand Rapids artistic community.

Grand Rapids also has a lively theater community. Grand Rapids Civic Theatre & School of Theatre Arts first opened in the 1920s (Calin Skidmore 2011). Civic Theatre is a community theater that is located in the downtown Grand Rapids area. Growth of the theater in the 1960s caused them to open a school for theatre arts in conjunction with Grand Rapids Public Schools and offer classes to young people to further strengthen its position in the community (Grand Rapids Civic Theatre 2011). Former Grand Rapids resident and stage actor Michael Brooks (2011) said, “It's next to impossible to seriously pursue theater in Grand Rapids and not do a show at the Civic.” The theater is very popular.
and is currently the 5th largest community theater in the country. The school trains approximately 1,600 students annually (Grand Rapids Civic Theatre 2011).

Another local theater is the Actors' Theatre of Grand Rapids. Actors' opened in 1980, it has become a vibrant and renowned theater. Actors' Theatre only performs original works to West Michigan, and is known to be more edgy in the plays they perform compared to the Civic Theatre or contemporaries (Brooks 2011). Actors' Theatre is also a community theater and many of the actors and actresses perform as volunteers or make modest pay from their performances. The theater community of Grand Rapids is not nearly as lavish or decadent as the theater community in the Cultural District of Pittsburgh.

The artistic community of Grand Rapids also draws energy from Division Avenue, which is a central point for most young artists in the city. The area around this street, between Fulton and Wealthy Street, has become a gathering place for the local artistic community in recent years. Vertigo Music is the largest music store in Grand Rapids and specializes in new and old vinyl records, and on any given day is the hang out for young bohemian types. Vertigo Music sits next to the home of the Division Ave Artistic Co-Operative, or simply known as the DAAC. The DAAC is a non-profit arts organization started by local student artists from nearby Calvin College nearly ten years ago. Hunter Bridwell (2011) who is a current member of the DAAC board stated, “The DAAC started because there were no all-ages art shows offered in the city.”

The DAAC is not much more than a storefront operation that has a maximum capacity of about 100 people. The DAAC is predominantly a music venue, but it also hosts art gallery shows, and offers free educational classes to the community and even yoga on weeknights. Everyone who works at the DAAC is a volunteer and even board members take turns working shows or teaching classes to keep the space open and functioning.
Dwelling Place is an organization that is working towards revitalizing South Division Ave as well as the greater Heartside neighborhood. Dwelling Place seeks to improve the lives of people by creating quality affordable housing, providing essential support services, and serving as a catalyst for neighborhood revitalization (Dwelling Place 2012). Dwelling Place has attributed to lining the South Division Business Corridor with a variety of live/work spaces. Designed with artists in mind, these spaces are uniquely situated for creative individuals and contain a variety of layouts (Dwelling Place 2012).

Division Ave is also home to the Division Ave Arts Festival, which occurs every summer. The festival has become a showcase for the district, though over the past couple years many businesses on Division Ave have closed their doors and that has caused the size and scope of the festival to shrink as well. Skelletones, which was once a predominant music venue on Division Ave and booked touring acts from all across the country, has recently closed down because of lack of business. Vertigo Music and the DAAC are continuing to keep Division Ave and the DIY artistic community relevant, alive and prosperous in Grand Rapids.

In recent history, one event looms over the collective artistic community of Grand Rapids. The creation of ArtPrize by Rick DeVos has caused Grand Rapids to become viewed as a cultural city nationally, and it has put attention on the local artistic community. There is no doubt that ArtPrize has had a significant positive impact on the local economy of Grand Rapids. The art competition has also drummed up media attention from around the world including the New York Times and the BBC. The statistics of ArtPrize speak for themselves: 1,582 artists submitted pieces to the 2011 ArtPrize competition; 39 different countries are represented; 164 venues display ArtPrize pieces for 19 days including 43 restaurants and bars; there are 177 outdoor pieces placed throughout downtown Grand Rapids; and the competition covers a total area of three square miles (Noddea Skidmore 2011).

Not every part of the artistic community in Grand Rapids is prospering like ArtPrize. The area
of South Division Street that is the home to the DAAC, Vertigo Music, and Store have become encapsulated into an artistic community called Avenue for the Arts. The idea for creating a unified Avenue for the Arts on Division Ave came before ArtPrize. Artists and business owners on South Division Ave have felt ignored by the city for years (Schaub 2011). Jenn Schaub (2011) believes the arts and activities happening on Division Ave have been overlooked in recent city redevelopment and ArtPrize only hurts Division Ave shop owners in trying to bring attention to Avenue for the Arts. There are businesses closing doors and artists struggling to get by who have lived in this community for years, and the city gives all their attention to ArtPrize because it brings in tourists and money and they ignore what's happening on Division (Schaub 2011).

Store, which is considered to be the retail side of Avenue for the Arts, only opened on Division Ave this past spring. The idea behind Store is to be a shop where local artists can sell their goods, and with all the empty storefronts on Division, the entire store can be easily moved to another location. The plan is to only have a temporary residence in any one location (Schaub 2011). The reason why Store is unique and easily removable is because all of the shelves and tables in Store are on wheels and compactable. It is literally a retail shop on wheels that can be moved to any storefront location. With many businesses closing on Division Avenue, the need for collapsible storefront businesses is not only very innovative, but practical. When you walk down Division Avenue you can't help but notice the empty storefronts on both sides of the block, but there is hope for the community.

POLICY ISSUES

While Grand Rapids created and had an active local artistic community, it lacked on the artistic community gaining significant national recognition until Rick DeVos founded ArtPrize in 2009. ArtPrize essentially changed everything and put the city in an international spotlight, and out of the
creation of ArtPrize there have been both perceived advantages and disadvantages associated with this continuing spotlight.

One main question is the proper role of the city government. ArtPrize is privately funded and operated and receives no money from the state or local government. The city takes a “hands off” approach with ArtPrize. The philosophy seems to be: if it’s not broke, don't fix it. Noddea Skidmore (2011), the event planner for ArtPrize as well as being a veteran of the local theater community, stated, “Recently, the city has given ArtPrize a right to refusal on any development in the downtown Grand Rapids area that could have a serious impact on how the ArtPrize event is planned.” That is an remarkable amount of power for a non-profit organization. ArtPrize has become more of a success than anyone could have anticipated with the city government remaining only a passive participant thus far. The city government needs to address its role of how it will interact with ArtPrize going forward. With ArtPrize expanding every year and with no signs for it to slow down anytime soon, the city government needs to decide if they want to remain passive with a laissez faire policy towards ArtPrize or become more active in ArtPrize’s planning and activities. Currently ArtPrize operates their agenda without any restrictions or interference from the Grand Rapids city government.

Another issue concerning ArtPrize is the general public's role in being a part of the ArtPrize community. ArtPrize has followd a top down approach since its creation by Rick DeVos and has received criticism for its lack of community outreach and involvement. There is also criticism surrounding ArtPrize being essentially run by Rick DeVos whose grandfather founded the Amway Corporation. Noddea Skidmore (2011) told me, “While it is minor, you do see ArtPrize cynics, and we've even had anti-ArtPrize protestors come to open forums and heckle us.” Only a small amount of people in the community, however, appear to distrust ArtPrize and the motives of the DeVos family.

Furthermore, there are issues with the relationship of ArtPrize and the artistic community of Grand Rapids. There is also a current estrangement between the Division Ave artistic community and
ArtPrize. Those I talked to at the DAAC and other Division Ave businesses feel they have been ignored and overlooked by ArtPrize. Jenn Schaub (2011), who is a local artist and runs Store, a nomadic consignment shop located on South Division Avenue (just a few buildings down from the DAAC and Vertigo Music) commented, “ArtPrize does their thing, and we do ours. ArtPrize is for tourists, and the art we are doing is for the local community.” Jenn also said, “ArtPrize gives away all this money to artists not from the community, while we (local artists) are struggling to keep our businesses open and keep the artistic community here feasible to continue doing.” Due to low art sales and lack of customers, Store is currently open only two days a week for a couple hours and its future is uncertain at best.

Jeff Vanderberg is a local entrepreneur in Grand Rapids. He owns the music record label Friction Records, is a board member of the DAAC (Division Avenue Arts Co-operative), and owns the bar called The Meanwhile (whose clientele is mostly made up of college students, musicians, and art students). Vanderberg also owns the newest music venue in Grand Rapids called The Pyramid Scheme. Despite all does for the artistic community in Grand Rapids, Vanderberg refused to be part of ArtPrize and not allow any of his establishments to be used as ArtPrize venues.

Hunter Bridwell (2011) is a local artist and also a DAAC board member commented, “Many of us in the local (art) scene, including Jeff, don't feel that ArtPrize has not reached out to the artistic community. While many of us have a mixed reaction to ArtPrize, Jeff so far has just wanted no part of it.” When people in the artistic community like Jeff Vanderberg don’t want to get involved with ArtPrize, it creates issues that need to be addressed going forward.

Another policy issue with ArtPrize is sustainability. ArtPrize was originally conceived as one event without any expectations for the long-term viability of the event repeating. ArtPrize has been a huge international success, and with 2011 marks its third year and it is shifting from a highly invested

57
art event to an annual city institution. If ArtPrize is going to continue and became an annual event, it needs to come up with a strategic plan of how it will integrate as a permanent fixture in the Grand Rapids culture and artistic community.

Redevelopment and gentrification of the commercial and residential district on Wealthy Street is a key policy issue. As mentioned before, Wealthy Street, which connects East Town to the downtown Grand Rapids area, went from being a bustling commercial, residential, and artistic hub in the early 20th century to a poverty stricken low-income area with little to no businesses left in operation. In the past few years there has been drastic redevelopment on the street, and the district has once again changed to an area of attraction and lots of nightlife. There are plans for the continued redevelopment of Wealthy Street with blighted buildings being turned into shops and apartments (Nicolas Persons 2009). The issue now is that the renewed interest in Wealthy Street is driving up prices and forcing many living on low incomes such as artists and students out of the area to other parts of the city.

FINDINGS

Grand Rapids has gone from being another mid-sized Midwestern city to be a prominent venue for artists and art lovers from across the world due to its ArtPrize public voting art competition. Yet Grand Rapids is clearly an anomaly. In a state that has seen recession for a decade, Grand Rapids is economically stable and it has not been affected by the current economic recession that has burdened much of the Midwest and Rustbelt area of the country. One contributing factor that sets Grand Rapids apart from other cities and the rest of the state of Michigan is the amount of local philanthropy. The DeVos family has had a large noticeable impact on Grand Rapids development. There are multiple structures, performance venues, to even a building at Grand Rapids Community College named after the DeVos family is visible almost everywhere. Grand Rapids is similar to Pittsburgh with the Heinz and Carnegie families in that sense with the amount of private philanthropy seen throughout the city.
ArtPrize has been Rick DeVos' opportunity to make a name for himself outside of Amway and the shadow of his father, Dick DeVos, who is a former Republican Gubernatorial candidate and large Republican Party fundraiser. The number of jobs the DeVos family through Amway or other means have created, along with the amount of privately donated philanthropy that occurs in Grand Rapids, has allowed the city to weather these financial hard times and actually see growth.

The infusion of art and commerce that takes place in ArtPrize is a fairly unique occurrence. Although ArtPrize is a yearly art competition that is a special event in the Grand Rapids community, it is in a very unique position of how it impacts the local artistic community and Grand Rapids development. ArtPrize has served as an economic and cultural catalyst in the city, and has garnered Grand Rapids national attention and put focus on the local artistic community. The impact of ArtPrize is so great that you cannot study the artistic community of Grand Rapids without including ArtPrize and its influence. ArtPrize is also crucial for this research, but it is so new that it is still growing and changing, and it is changing the artistic community along with it. It is currently hard to measure the long-term impact of ArtPrize on the community, but with the organization’s intentions of settling down as a year round institution and not just a yearly art event ArtPrize could realistically weave itself into the fabric of the Grand Rapids artistic community. Research on ArtPrize is important because it lays the foundation of examining this artistic event as it attempts to evolve into a component of the local artistic community.

ArtPrize submissions are displayed throughout the city and not just in the notable places you would expect, such as galleries, museums, and venues, but also in many bars, restaurants, coffee shops, and even hotels. People can vote on art submissions while they drink a beer or buy a coffee, and the competition is very friendly to the public in means of their ease of interaction in order to vote on pieces. That mixture of ArtPrize with business has also drawn criticism from many people. Hunter
Bridwell (2011) noted, “It is hard to do your daily business or just enjoy a meal because you will be sitting in a restaurant trying to eat and you will constantly be bumped by people who are coming in and out of every business just to look and vote on art pieces, but they are not normally buying anything or even caring what the place is selling.”

With $500,000 given out in prize money that is selected by a public vote, it is very easy to get caught up in the grandiose spectacle that is ArtPrize. During ArtPrize, there is a feeling in the air that the event is something special and different from what is going on in terms of public art anywhere else. The downtown area of Grand Rapids will see an estimated 100,000 visitors over the course of the 19 days that ArtPrize lasts (Noddea Skidmore 2011). The downtown is teeming with crowds of people and temporary nightlife that exemplifies the hustle and bustle atmosphere one would see in major cities like New York, Chicago, or Los Angeles and art is the center of all of it. The Grand Rapids Art Museum (GRAM) is the largest and most crowded ArtPrize venue, but surrounding the GRAM are publicly displayed ArtPrize pieces up and down all the main streets leading to the GRAM in downtown Grand Rapids. What is interesting to see going forward is how the now 501(c)3 non-profit organization will forward with its relationship with the city government, the people of Grand Rapids, and the local artistic community.

A major positive impact ArtPrize has made on Grand Rapids is the absorbent amount of public participation involved in the event. Artists from around the world come to Grand Rapids to participate in ArtPrize, and thousands of visitors come to the city to participate in viewing ArtPrize submissions and voting on them. It is a major victory to how much public participation ArtPrize is able to gather out of community citizens. In the literature Christopher Walker commented on public participation in the arts trickled over to increased participation in other activities that improve the community. ArtPrize is showing it is an engine for producing public participation in its activities, and possibly in the long-term future will also cause an increase in public participation of the local artistic community and other
Grand Rapids community activities.

With that being said about the current state of ArtPrize, there is just as much talk and interest in the future of the art competition and what it means for the future of Grand Rapids. Policy issues mentioned earlier pertaining to ArtPrize are their relationship with the city government, Grand Rapids public, and local artistic community going forward. Noddea Skidmore (2011) stated, “This year ArtPrize started opening some meetings to the general public, letting anyone who is curious to come in and see how ArtPrize is run and organized.” Skidmore also said that she hoped to continue these open meetings to the community and believes that the amount of public transparency will increase over the years as ArtPrize grows as an organization. Noddea (2011) also commented, “The city now has a representative at most ArtPrize meetings and we (ArtPrize) hope to keep good relations with the city as we continue to grow.”

ArtPrize's relationship to the local artistic community nonetheless will likely remain strained. 2011 is the first year musical artists have been allowed to be submitted as ArtPrize submission and, starting next year, ArtPrize is planning to take place at the same time as the Grand Rapids Film Festival (Noddea Skidmore 2011). ArtPrize has taken steps to integrate more of the local artistic community to be involved in ArtPrize, but to many artists, it hasn't been enough. Cultural participation as discussed by Fancie Ostrower in the literature is a way to strengthen artistic partnerships in a community, and it could serve as a mechanism to increase ArtPrize’s credibility and foster a more engaging relationship with the local artistic community.

The Avenue for the Arts is a non-profit group that works to serve the artistic happenings going on in the community and works to bring renewed attention to the area. Chris Oposnow (2011), a Grand Rapids artist and currently a DAAC board member, commented, “There is a growing DIY movement by artists on Division, and that's probably because many feel that to keep this community going they
have to do it themselves.” The Avenue for the Arts serves as a catalyst for the entrepreneurial do it yourself mentality of brand new art galleries that seem to have sprung up on Division Avenue overnight.

The Avenue for the Arts is bringing more than a retail aspect to this street. The Dinderbeck Studio is a brand new art gallery and performance space that opened this year on Division. It is important to note that Dinderbeck Studio is a DIY gallery that was started out of the need of not having enough spaces in the city to promote local artists' work. The gallery is located in the 2nd story of a loft building, and if you didn't know where the Dinderbeck Studio was you'd be hard pressed to find it. There are no signs or markers that indicate the entrance to the studio. ArtPrize very much plays to the lowest common denominator, so it's hard to find art for the sake of art in galleries promoted by the city because they are focused on art for the sake of money (Michael Brooks 2011). Kyle Isbell (2011), who is involved with the Dinderbeck Studio, commented, “Dinderbeck is friendly atmosphere and anyone can come check it out. Our focus is to promote local art and help local artists get exposed to a hopefully appreciative audience.”

Right down the street from the Dinderbeck Studio on Division Ave is the Free-Radicals Gallery. Hunter Bridwell (2011) who besides being involved with the DAAC is also involved with the Free-Radicals Gallery. The gallery is just another outlet that local artists have been wanting and need. It features pieces by local artists, and is a good alternative to the commercialized ArtPrize (Bridwell 2011). The Free-Radical Gallery is also a DIY gallery and has no flashy sign or clearly marked entrance. Many of the galleries popping up are nothing more than an open loft space in a building or someone's personal art space that they've opened up to local artists and the public. While the empty storefronts remain on Division, there is more life on the street than there used to be and there is a DIY grassroots artistic community sprouting to grow on the Avenue for the Arts.

Wealthy Street, which connects downtown Grand Rapids to Eastown, has gained renewed
attention in recent years due to artist friendly redevelopment. It later part of the 20th century, like many post-industrial communities, the area fell on hard economic times and many businesses closed their doors, including the Wealthy Street Theater. Starting in the 1990's, there were signs of hope on Wealthy Street. The first major project was the restoration of the Wealthy Street Theater, and with the wake of the restoration of the theater done by the city came interest to further redevelop and gentrify the area. Richard Florida would argue that redeveloping and gentrifying an area like Wealthy Street can easily drive out artists and long-time residents if not handled carefully. It will be important for the local community to be involved with the redevelopment of Wealthy Street to ensure rapid gentrification and spiked increase in cost of living does not incur to current residents. The redevelopment is definitely changing local perception of the area, and renewed interest due to redevelopment has also brought with it new residents with larger disposable incomes to the area, and driven out much of the crime element that was once there.

Just a few years ago many would say don't hang around Wealthy Street at night and its reputation for having a high African-American population coupled with large amounts of poverty kept the area in ruins, but now it has a bustling nightlife, and a hotspot for college students and young professionals, to socialize. One of the prominent new businesses on Wealthy is a bar run by Jeff Vandenberg called The Meanwhile, attracts young people from the area and, once inside, has the feel of a hip Brooklyn or Wicker Park bar with cheap beers, paintings by local artists on the walls, and a jukebox full of underground as well as local artists. There are many boutique shops and hidden restaurants on Wealthy and neighboring Eastown that are giving the street a real bohemian feel and clientele. Wealthy Street and Eastown have developed social environments that cater to creative types and is now a source of nightlife and entertainment that scholars Richard Lloyd and Elizabeth Currid as necessary components for a city to have a sustainable artistic community.
Grand Rapids is growing throughout a transitional period and trying to get put on the map for the arts. As the city continues to expand and draws more attention from tourists and businesses, it will have to prove it is more than a one trick pony. Grand Rapids will have to find ways to integrate ArtPrize into the local artistic community and put a focus on redeveloping other areas of the city besides those where ArtPrize is located. With proper strategic planning, Grand Rapids could build a credible and sustainable artistic community on par with those find in major cities. Much of Grand Rapids fate lies in the policy decisions they make going forward now that ArtPrize is an established institution in the city.
With the creation of the Bessemer Process in the 19th century, Pittsburgh rose to a dominant position in steel production. The city played a vital role in the American industrialization of the late 1890's and early 1900's. As with many U.S. cities, beginning in the 1970's, however, the demand for steel decreased with a rising global market. As steel production grew in other parts of the world, it fell sharply in Pittsburgh. Amid a painful transition during the past two decades, the city has been struggling for a new commercial identity.

Pittsburgh is a bit of a cultural enigma, partially due to its geography. Sitting in western Pennsylvania, it is a blue-collar city on the border of the Allegheny Mountains. The city and regional area has a very Midwestern tone and feel, and sits on the eastern edge of the Rust Belt. Though it is isolated from most of the Midwest, it does have influence on the East Coast which is geographically closer. Even the Pittsburgh accent resembles something closer to how you'd hear someone speak in Philadelphia, Maryland, or New York rather than Chicago or the rest of the Midwest.

Those who I talked to from Pittsburgh note the enigmatic aspects of Pittsburgh culture have played a role in its artistic communities. Ian Williams, guitarist and keyboardist of the internationally renowned rock band Battles, grew up in Pittsburgh in the 1980's and saw the artistic community transform entering the 1990's and carrying through to today. Williams rose to prominence in the 1990's as a guitarist in the seminal Pittsburgh post-rock band Don Caballero. Don Caballero were signed to the famous Chicago based independent record label Touch & Go Records. Williams went on to live in Chicago in the mid-90s before moving to New York in the early 2000's. He has continued to be part of the musical communities in both Pittsburgh and Chicago, and has left a lasting impact on the indie-rock
scene in both cities.

Williams (2011) described Pittsburgh as, “Not Midwestern, but not East Coast either.” He noted that the city did have a blue-collar mentality that would resonate with the Midwest, but it has other variables as well. “Pittsburgh is really interesting because it is really a mix of Philadelphia and Baltimore culture, as well as a mix of Detroit and Cleveland, but also with West Virginia influence as well,” he noted (2011). Williams went on to describe the artistic community in Pittsburgh as feeling isolated from other places and how out of that comes good and bad things. “Pittsburgh held on after industry left and that allowed the arts to continue and evolve there. The isolation of Pittsburgh has allowed the community to create weird and off beat culture” (Williams 2011).

The city government of Pittsburgh recognized a need to try and re-establish the city in order to survive the decline of industry. Beginning in the 1990's, Pittsburgh began putting focus on developing medical technology and other science based businesses. PNC Bank has its headquarters in Pittsburgh as well and there has been some economic growth in the city. Even with new investment and businesses landing in Pittsburgh it couldn't stop an exodus of many workers and families in the wake of industrial decline. Pittsburgh suffered a 8.6% decrease in population, declining from 334,563 residents in 2000 to 305,704 residents in 2010 (U.S. Census Bureau Pittsburgh QuickFacts 2010). Redeveloping the downtown area with a focus on the arts and culture is one tool the city is utilizing to slow the decline in population and bring renewed interest and attraction to the city.
Figure 3.

Schematics of Artistic Community Sites
Located in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

Map created by William Covert; not to scale.
The Future Tenant is a recently opened art venue, located in the Cultural District and run by the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust.
The Cultural District is located in Downtown Pittsburgh.

The Marquee of the Historic Byham Theatre tried to convey a feeling of Broadway while sitting in the middle of the Cultural District in Downtown Pittsburgh.
There are many unused, but strategically located buildings in Downtown Pittsburgh. The picture above shows one of many sites primed for redevelopment in the Cultural District.
Altar Bar is a Music Venue Located in the Strip District That is an unique redevelopment, because it formerly served as a church in the area.

HISTORY

Historically, the artistic and cultural center of Pittsburgh resided in what is known as the Hill District. The Hill District is bordered by downtown Pittsburgh to the west, the Strip District to the north, and Oakland to the east. The Hill District rose to prominence in Pittsburgh in the 1930's – 1950's. The area is predominantly African-American and was home to many African-American writers, poets, painters, and musicians including the playwright August Wilson. Of August Wilson's 10 play Pittsburgh cycle (a multi-part stage play), nine took place in the Hill District, and the play’s made August an
artistic and cultural leader for the area. Ella Fitzgerald and Duke Ellington both performed at clubs in the Hill District during its popular heyday (August Wilson Center for African American Culture 2011).

The Hill District had a bustling nightlife for decades up until the 1960's when many clubs and bars were forced to close in the area as unemployment rose and many residents became poverty stricken with the loss of heavy industry jobs in Pittsburgh. Redevelopment of the Lower Hill District in the 1960's caused the city of Pittsburgh to displace roughly 8,000 residents and 400 businesses to build the Civic Arena, which at the time was the home of the Pittsburgh Penguins (August Wilson Center 2011). The area never recovered from this ill-conceived redevelopment. The area suffered from crime and drugs throughout the 1980's and with it went the artistic community that once thrived. Even the cop drama television show Hill Street Blues was named after the Hill District. Now redevelopment in the district has resumed, for the first time in decades there is optimism for the area, this raises the question of whether transforming the area will again make it an artistic hub.

When discussing the history of Pittsburgh and how the city has related to its artistic community, one has to consider the impact of philanthropy. Pittsburgh has an unusually large number of philanthropic foundations compared to most U.S. Cities. The most famous of these foundations are the Carnegie Foundation and the Heinz Endowment. The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust has played a role in the centralized planning to build an artistic community in over the past 20 years.

The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust, a non-profit foundation, is the brainchild of U.S. Senator Henry John Heinz II. He wanted to transform Pittsburgh's dingy and dilapidated downtown into a modern cultural district that would spur urban revitalization through the arts and create a downtown entertainment destination (Pittsburgh Cultural Trust 2011). The trust was started in 1984 and today is a multi-faceted organization that serves as a performance arts presenter, theater and gallery owner and operator, a catalyst for Cultural District real estate development, and community collaborator
The Pittsburgh Cultural District located in the downtown area of the city owes much of its development to the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust, which has been seen by the public as both good and bad for the local artistic community.

POLICY ISSUES

Pittsburgh is again undergoing a period of redevelopment. Modern development and planning have brought a number of policy issues to the forefront regarding the already existing and also emerging artistic communities in the city and what their relationship is to areas undergoing redevelopment. The main areas in Pittsburgh with policy issues that deal with the artistic community are the Hill District, Oakland, the Waterfront, and the Cultural District.

The redevelopment in The Hill District, in the 1960’s as mentioned earlier, left a negative social impact on the area. Now the community is undergoing new redevelopment intended to revitalize it. The main policy issue concerning the redevelopment of the Hill District is the high level of poverty in the area. According to the 2000 Census, about 40% of the Hill District's residents live below the poverty line, and only 6% of the district's population is white yet the rest of the city of Pittsburgh is a majority white population with a higher median income in comparison to the Hill (Pittsburgh Department of City Planning 2006). The problem with redevelopment in the Hill District is it was the redevelopment in the 1960s that displaced many residents and businesses in the community and there is much distrust from current residents about city planned redevelopment for the area. Without redevelopment there is not much hope for the future of the district due to the lack of new businesses and residents entering the area and the Hill District landed in a real catch-22 situation.

Oakland is an area of Pittsburgh that is going through its own bout with redevelopment. The area of Oakland is in the Southwest portion of the city and the home to many young people who are either college students at nearby Pittsburgh University, artists, or young professionals. A main policy
issue arising in the Oakland area is gentrification. Oakland has predominantly been inhabited by students due to its centralized location near the University of Pittsburgh, but in recent years the area has seen a lot of gentrification development. Local musician and veteran of the Pittsburgh music scene Ben Huebacher (2011), commented, “Oakland is becoming a more expensive place to live and to be social. The area is definitely showing signs of change.”

Pittsburgh is located on the intersection of three rivers: the Allegheny, the Monongahela, and the Ohio rivers. When steel was the main industry in the city, the rivers were an important and vital support to the city for the import and export goods and materials. Now in the wake of the post-industrial era, there are many empty and abandoned buildings and areas on the waterfront. PNC Park, home of the Pittsburgh Pirates, and Heinz Field, the home of the Steelers, are recently built stadiums along the river system west of downtown, but much of the area surrounding the stadiums has yet to be redeveloped. The problem lies in deciding how to redevelop this part of the city that was once so strategic in its vitality. A strong influence from individuals like J.H Heinz and the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust in redeveloping the area to feature an artistic and cultural component is essential to its revitalization.

The downtown area of Pittsburgh has another issue regarding redevelopment that relates to the artistic community in the city. The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust was created to form an artistic and cultural hub in downtown Pittsburgh and use the arts to bring people together and stimulate the downtown area that was left empty and barren in the wake of industry leaving the Pittsburgh area. The main problem created was to what affect would the artistic community have in the revitalization in the downtown, and what would their interaction be with the city in creating an artistic and cultural hub.
FINDINGS

The city of Pittsburgh is going through a transitional period from being a heavy industrial giant without the nightlife that supports a young creative class to a modern city with investment in new economies such as medical and nano technologies, and a large investment by the city and non-profit organizations to create a sustainable artistic community. Urban planning is playing a crucial role in the cultivation of an artistic community in Pittsburgh. What follows are some examples from my site visits to Pittsburgh of what is happening with the emerging artistic community.

One major development program in Pittsburgh right now is happening in the Hill District. This project includes the first, newly opened grocery store and pharmacy in the area for over 30 years and a plan to restore the New Granada Theater. The theater is a historic jazz club where both Ella Fitzgerald and Duke Ellington once performed (August Wilson Center 2011). The idea behind the plan is to restore and reopen the theater with the hopes it will help revitalize the artistic community of the district that had once been the entertainment backbone of the city.

Some of the people I interviewed are skeptical of the district's ability to rebound with the way the city has been redeveloping the area. Lauren McReynolds (2011), a local stage actress from Pittsburgh who has recently relocated from the city said, “The city ignored the Hill for decades and now they are trying to make up for it by just pouring money in the district like all is forgiven.” Lauren studied art and theater history, specifically theater in Pittsburgh and the Hill District, and while she'd like to see those venues of prominence rise back to popularity and usability in modern times, is cynical about the city's plan for the area. “I really hope the New Granada Theater can be a modern success story, but most of the area is pretty poor and just restoring the theater itself isn't going to draw people back to the Hill for the arts when the neighborhood surrounding the theater isn't safe (McReynolds 2011),” she notes others think the redevelopment of the Hill District is on the right track. Michael
Brooks (2011), stage actor, musician, writer, and graphic designer originally from Pittsburgh who now resides in Chicago commented, “Whether the restoration of the New Granada Theater is a success or not, it has people talking about the Hill District again and remembering the artistic community that was once there and maybe can shed a light on the poverty and problems still affecting the area going forward.”

It remains to be seen if the redevelopment of the Hill District can have a positive social impact on the area. The area is in desperate need of revitalization as well as residential and commercial redevelopment. It is refreshing to see the artistic community as part of the revitalization of the Hill District, but there is more needed to bring this community back from being a central marker for blight, poverty, and crime to being an integral social, economic, and cultural destination in Pittsburgh.

One neighborhood that really stands out as being attractive to the local artistic community is Oakland. When walking the streets of Oakland, one discerns a distinctly different feel from the rest of the city. Due to the recent development of new commercial businesses including coffee shops, bars, music venues, and boutique retail stores, the area has a growing social nightlife and is a meeting point for many local artists. Oakland has a mixture of both spontaneous artist activity in the area and commercial redevelopment, and has close proximity to Pittsburgh University.

These qualities were evident when interviewing Joy Ike (2011), a local musician, who moved to New York and then came back to Pittsburgh because she felt that its music community was more conducive for her creative endeavors. Ms. Ike has been playing music in Pittsburgh for seven years, and has mixed feelings about the music scene. Joy (2011) commented, “There is room for the arts to grow in Pittsburgh, but the community doesn't have an identity yet, and much of the art scene is hidden.” Joe went on to say, “The DIY (Do It Yourself) route is the best way to book gigs and shows and get your art seen. There is not as much competition in the art community in Pittsburgh as in other cities such as New York.”
Joy, who has a background in public relations, observed one negative attribute in the Pittsburgh music community. “Less competition equals less drive,” she concluded (2011). Joy started a blog specifically designed to help artists market themselves with helpful tips and suggestions. The blog is called Manufacturer of Ideas and currently receives around 5,000 views per month. Joy believes the internet can play a vital role in the artistic community and bringing artists together, “Online is a great way to make connections and allows artists to diversify their networking capabilities,” she noted (2011).

While Joy said Pittsburgh is a great place to make a living, it is also gradually becoming more expensive to live there. Much of Oakland has gentrified and faces a rise in costs. Besides the issue of gentrification, Oakland has become the center for underground art in the city. There are many DIY music venues and performance art spaces located in or around the area of Oakland. Aside from posters hung up in local coffee shops and bars, blogs focused on the Pittsburgh artistic community, or word of mouth -- it's pretty hard to find shows that usually occur in empty industrial buildings.

There are compelling reasons to believe the continued gentrification of Oakland will have a negative impact on the underground art scene that is comprised of mostly younger and lower income residents. Maxwell Beehner (2011), a local area artist and musician and lifelong resident of Pittsburgh, and he suggested, “The underground art community will survive in Pittsburgh because there is a demand for it. The scene may move out of Oakland, but it will survive because there is a young audience that demands it.” While the city is trying to revamp its image a modern and cultural 21st Century city, there are still many abandoned warehouses and factory buildings throughout the city which have been a great advantage to the underground art scene to be used as make-shift music venues, art galleries, and performance spaces. Amid gentrification occurs and stepped up efforts to clean up the city, the harder it will be for the underground art community to freely move about and find spaces that
are low rent or rent free.

Downtown Pittsburgh is the largest area of the city to see artist-centric development take place. The downtown area is home to the Pittsburgh Cultural District, which consists of multiple city blocks that feature theaters, art galleries, and music venues that have mostly been planned by the city and financed by the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust (Brooks 2011). The Pittsburgh Cultural District emerged with the opening of the Heinz Hall in 1971, followed by the opening of Bynam Theater and the Benedum Center for Performing Arts (The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust 2011). All these theaters are within a city block of each other, and are designed to give a very Broadway like feel. Although the planned redevelopment to form the Cultural District is expansive, that area has a very different feel and more affluent appearance than the artistic communities of Oakland and the Hill District. The Cultural District is a strictly planned area and not a result of any spontaneous activities or artistic movements and is focused on the arts as being commercially viable.

The waterfront area connected to downtown Pittsburgh has also seen a lot of planned city development. The old Pittsburgh & Lake Erie Railroad Depot has been redeveloped as a state-of-the-art reception hall, keeping intact much of the facade from the station and making it a new destination on the waterfront facing downtown. The city has also built an outdoor amphitheater on the waterfront area next to the old central station that features live concerts throughout the summer and is now home to the Three Rivers Art Festival, which is the largest arts festival in Pittsburgh and attracts much attention in the surrounding area (Huebacher 2011). (The 2011 Three Rivers Arts Festival featured solo artist Joy Ike, who I interviewed.) The newly developed amphitheater on the waterfront of the Monongahela River also is a host venue to the VIA visual arts and music festival, which is put on by the city (Ike, 2011). The headlining act at the 2011 VIA festival was Ian Williams' band Battles. The waterfront development has been a great example of city planning due to the large costs involved in the project and their big rewards.
The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust also opened the Wood Street Galleries, which have become the staple art galleries in the city and have been considered a success in the creation of a Cultural District in the city's downtown. The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust has now recently started investing in what they call “sister galleries” all over the Cultural District that are run by students and young professionals and appeal more to the underground art scene of the city. Marissa Cinquanti (2011) is the performance programming manager at Future Tenant Art Space, one of the sister galleries to the Wood Street Galleries. Marissa explained, “Future Tenant is run by mostly students from Carnegie Mellon University and is a great hands on experience to know what it's like to run a gallery and be involved on the business side of art” (Cinquanti 2011). Marissa also described the level of community at Future Tenant by stating, “Anyone can come in here and see what we have going on. We exclude nobody, and we want everyone to experience art and hopefully experience it with us.” Future Tenant is nothing more than a store front gallery with revolving artists bringing in works to be shown and has a very bohemian feel to its operation.

While the Wood Street Galleries convey the traditional feel of fine art and cultural elitism, Future Tenant does quite the opposite. The long-term issue will be if the trust can keep the funding up on these new galleries. The impact this has on the artistic community is the fact that much of the artistic and cultural development of the downtown area is from either government funded projects or philanthropic organizations, but there aren’t too many artists operating in the Cultural District independently. The issue this creates is the feeling of an artificial community. It raises the question of whether artists will be able to survive on their own in downtown Pittsburgh without government or philanthropic funding.

In summary, I found the following: 1. There is a very strong, top-down approach as to how the Cultural District and downtown redevelopment occurred. 2. The city of Pittsburgh is in the process of
trying to reshape its image as a gritty industrial powerhouse into a modern city built on cutting edge science with nano technologies and bio-medical sciences with a large focus on culture and a downtown area with a new nightlife due to the creation of the Cultural District as well as many new bars and business along the waterfront area and over in the Oakland neighborhood. 3. Whether the downtown area or currently redeveloped Hill District can encompass the energy and hip reputation an area like Oakland (which developed with a more grassroots efforts from the young creative class) remains to be seen. Going forward, Pittsburgh has some serious issues, but also a bright outlook compared to many other cities coming out of the recession.
CHAPTER 8:  
COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS: CHICAGO

The city of Chicago differs from the other post-industrial cities considered in this report. It has retained its large-scale workforce and had much success strengthening its downtown district. Like other post-industrial cities, Chicago also has an emerging artistic community. Chicago is currently the cultural and artistic hub for the Midwest, the arts have had a noticeable impact on the city. The economic and cultural status Chicago has maintained through the recession has made it the benchmark for other cities to try and reach.

The size and scope of Chicago and its artistic community is of such a scale and magnitude that rather than do an extensive study of the artistic community and movements in Chicago, this chapter offers a brief comparative assessment with Pittsburgh, Grand Rapids, and Detroit.
Figure 4.
Schematics of Artistic Community Sites in Chicago, Illinois.

Map created by William Covert; not to scale.
The Orphanage, Located in the Bridgeport Neighborhood, is formerly a church that has been converted into a DIY music venue and visual arts gallery.
The Pilsen Neighborhood is teeming with street art which marks the area as an emerging artistic community.

The DIY Warehouse Space known as Treasure Town is an underground art venue where numerous artists live and work. Treasure Town keeps its address hidden from the public out of fear of removal from the building.
Treasure Town has become a mecca for underground arts culture in Chicago.

Chicago has art across the city that is derived from different origins and creation on the spectrum of spontaneous artistic inspiration to planned, strategic art installations. Chicago is now on the verge of becoming more invested in the arts with new mayor Rahm Emanuel. Emanuel has said since the campaign trail, and now in that he's in office, that he wants to see the arts integrated more into the lives of Chicago neighborhoods and residents (Malooley 2011). From a policy standpoint, in order to judge the effectiveness of policies to support and cultivate the arts, you need to understand the impact of already existing artistic communities on populations and how other artistic communities were able to be successful. Mayor Richard Daley was successful at using the arts to send a message about the diversity and attractiveness of Chicago. Daley empowered the city's Department of Cultural Affairs by turning it into a major tool in civic development (Hoppe 2011). Emanuel looks to follow suit and apparently plans to make the arts a major focus (Hoppe 2011).

Most of the art that people are familiar with in Chicago is from planned art policies carried out
by the city and large art-focused organizations. These famous pieces of planned art include the sculptures and amphitheater at Millennium Park, the modern wing addition to the Chicago Art Institute, sculptures in various urban parks in the city, the mural on at the CTA Red Line Morse stop, Wicker Park Fest, the giant sculpted Puerto Rico flags on Division Ave, the creation of Broadway in Chicago, and many others. Much of the art found in the Loop, like the various theaters off of State St, is similar to the kind of artistic center that Pittsburgh is trying to create with its Riverfront development by the city and their implementation of a cultural district. While these planned art strategies, pieces, and events have brought great attention and have helped solidify the arts and culture of Chicago, the real story of the artistic community is what's happening on a grassroots level, underneath the glitz and glam of what is noticeable on the surface.

Chicago has a vibrant artistic community of underground and independent art performance spaces that is the heart beating under the thick skin of the city proper. Public transportation is a crucial part of the Chicago DIY artistic community (Trentacost 2011). Nick Trentacost (2011) explained, “Transportation makes a bigger area seem smaller. Most kids who go to music and art shows in Chicago take public transportation, so being close to public transportation is very important for art spaces.” Two areas in the city in particular that have neighborhoods with intensive fervor for Do It Yourself art and grassroots organic art organizations are located in northwest Chicago in the Logan Square, Avondale, and Wicker Park neighborhoods, and the area south of the loop in the Pilsen and Bridgeport neighborhoods. Of those two areas of the city seeing large artistic movements emerge, the two neighborhoods that have the most artistic activity happening are Logan Square and Pilsen. Both neighborhoods share common characteristics with other artistic communities in post-industrial cities as well as unique characteristics to their specific social environment, culture, and artistic goals.

The artistic community of Pilsen is closest in comparison to the underground artistic movement
in Detroit. Their ethnic working-class neighborhood has a lot of residential housing comparative to other neighborhoods found in the city of Chicago. A large influx of young and mostly white artists are moving to Pilsen because of the relatively low cost of living to pursue the arts. The residents of Pilsen to embrace the artistic renaissance. The community is reinventing itself around the arts in a similar fashion to neighborhoods in Detroit.

A major component of the renaissance is street art. Street art is public art that is done in public places with usually a social or political commentary on society. It has become very prevalent in Pilsen much like it is in Detroit. Street art is a method used by some artists to use empty storefronts or houses as an art canvas and convey a message to the community or just make the empty building look more attractive. It is a “guerrilla style” tactic to beautify an unused building.

Pilsen has become the home to a host of DIY art spaces and loft galleries. Throughout Pilsen and nearby Bridgeport, people are using lofts and homes as makeshift performance and gallery spaces with much of the promotion done by word of mouth. Sculpture artist Lex Reed, who moved from Oakland, California, to Pilsen to pursue visual arts, described a loft gallery he was asked to be part of in Bridgeport. Reed (2011) said, “It is a community that is based a lot around who you know because when someone is hosting a gallery show in their loft and 100 people show up they want to know everyone there. I was asked to be part of a gallery show and only promote by word of mouth to only people I know and not put the address or any information of the show on the internet.” It is hard to even know where art shows and performances are taking place because it is very much an underground movement. It is much like Scrummage Fest in Detroit, where the venue for the performances always changes. It’s done mostly out of peoples’ homes or lofts or in unused or abandoned spaces.

The Orphanage is another makeshift performance art venue and gallery. The Orphanage, located in Bridgeport, is run by a group of artists who volunteer to work shows in a church in the Bridgeport community that is no longer used. The venue is becoming gaining attention in Chicago and on any
given weekend will host music concerts, short performance plays, dance groups, or host an art showing. (I attended a concert at The Orphanage, and found its reuse of a church to be fascinating). They built a stage for performance and have makeshift tables with chairs pulled up to for audience members to sit. They also use the church’s old kitchen to make a vegetarian buffet for every show that is free to every audience member. There was definitely the sense and feeling of community at The Orphanage and I talked to numerous audience members who attend the space weekly regardless of what performance is happening. It may be an old church that is no longer conducting church services, but the events going on inside are still bringing people together with a sense of community and belonging.

The artistic community of Logan Square has similarities to the artistic communities emerging in Detroit, the Oakland neighborhood in Pittsburgh, and Division Ave in Grand Rapids. Logan Square has an underground artistic community that is evolving at a very fast rate which makes it unique when compared to the artistic communities found in other cities. Ian Williams (2011) who lived in Chicago during the mid-90's to early 2000's commented, “Art communities grow in waves. The first wave happens in large cities where more artists tend to congregate, then the second wave is when those movements move on to the smaller cities.” Williams (2011) went on to explain, “Creative movements can evolve faster in Chicago than Pittsburgh just because the artistic community is larger in Chicago.”

The artistic community of Logan Square operates at an underground level that is evolving at such a fast rate it's hard to say how expansive the community actually is. Trevor de Brauw is a Chicago native and guitarist in the internationally acclaimed instrumental rock band Pelican. de Brauw (2011) explained, “It's easy to lose touch with the DIY scene. I'd go on tour and come back to Chicago and I thought the DIY scene was dead because I didn't hear about any shows and all the house venues I knew of where shut down. Then I found out from a friend who was still involved with the community that there were all kinds of DIY, underground shows going on, but I had just lost touch with that
community. You have to reintegrate with the scene if you aren't involved with the shows for a given amount of time.” De Brauw (2011) also commented, “Chicago is not a single artistic community, it's too big of a city. There are fragmented, smaller scenes throughout the city.” Fragmented or smaller scenes is very much the feel of what is going on in Logan Square. You can be involved with one community and go to all kinds of shows and play in the scene, but you go to a different string of DIY venues run by different people and they won't know you or be familiar with what you're doing (de Brauw 2011).

The rapid speed at which DIY venues change and the commitment needed to stay involved in the community is much more apparent in the Chicago artistic community than in smaller cities like Pittsburgh or Grand Rapids. Harrison Hickok is an artist who use to operate a DIY house venue called Summer Camp in Logan Square. Harrison (2011) explained, “It’s hard to get involved with the DIY community if you don’t really even know where to start. Luckily, I was in a band that was eagerly accepted into it.” This seems to be a recurring problem in artistic communities. Empty structures and loft spaces available for makeshift art performances serve as a great benefit to artists. One problem with that is many DIY venues operate illegally so in order to allow the shows to take place and continue, but without being stopped by the police or building owners, shows hop from one impromptu DIY performance space to another. Without being committed to the community, it's very easy to lose track of where and when the community operates.

John Yingling is a guru of the DIY music scene in Chicago and he's made it his mission to capture as many of the house and warehouse DIY shows as possible. He runs a website called Gonzo Chicago in which he posts pictures and videos of bands from various music venues including house shows. John (2011) explained, “The Midwest is a strange beast, and has an artistic collective that has developed differently than the East or West coasts. I'd see touring bands come through Chicago and opt not to play well known venues like the Empty Bottle or Schubas, but some dirty old warehouse. You're
seeing that more and more now.” With regards to the amount of house venues in operation, Yingling (2011) went on to say, “There are currently 6-8 spots running shows consistently, 2-3 that have closed in the past few months, and 2-3 cropping up as we speak.”

The power of the DIY underground artistic community is its ability to transcend trends and reinvigorate neighborhoods. While it's very hard to fully know how expansive the underground show scene is in Logan Square, many young people have flocked to the neighborhood to be part of the community. Hickok (2011) said, “Part of the beauty of the DIY community is its fragility. The economy has no impact on what we do. Popular trends are hardly even acknowledged in any fashion. If DIY venues are closed down, it's because people move on as people do.” Yingling disagreed that the DIY community is as loose and hard to pin down as many believe. Chicago has a Midwest vibe to it, and the scene is extremely personable, while tightly knit, but anyone can go to these shows and anyone can play in these shows (Yingling 2011).

Milwaukee Ave has seen a rebirth of nightlife. On any given Saturday night you can hear live music coming from some loft or basement at some location in the square. Arts has brought Logan Square together as a community, which had previously been a majority ethnic neighborhood on a downward economic turn similar to Wealthy Street in Grand Rapids or North Hamtramck in Detroit. Now, non-profit organizations like I Am Logan Square operate by putting art galleries in empty store fronts and promoting legal shows in more conventional art venues. The community is starting to go from the underground to out in the open. Walking down Milwaukee Ave between California and Diversey now has a similar look and feel to what is happening in Grand Rapids on Division Ave or Oakland in Pittsburgh where empty store fronts are being occupied by artists, art galleries, coffee shops, music stores, and bars.

A major similarity I noticed between the artistic community of Chicago and those in Detroit
specifically is the attitude of the people. In Grand Rapids, people are grateful for the artistic community they have, but there is a lot of uncertainty for the future and what will happen. Most of the artistic redevelopment in Pittsburgh is so new that, despite the positive feelings, there is also uncertainty about the community’s survival (Ike 2011). The overall artistic communities in Chicago and Detroit have a similar attitude of positivity and hope. Hickok (2011) asserted, “The artistic community in Chicago has more going on for it than other place despite its flaws. Everything comes in waves and the community will be able to rebuild itself following hard times.” Nick Trentacost (2011) recanted, “There are house venues closing in Chicago and it is easy to get disconnected from the scene, but it is a unified scene. Art is the common bond that brings everyone together. The DIY artistic community is built on similar ideals and it makes kids want to participate and learn and get involved in their scene.” John Yingling (2011) said, “The shows are only getting bigger and better, and the community is continuing to grow and have an impact in the redevelopment of the city.”

Chicago has a dense and layered artistic community that is sprawled across the city. The artistic community of Chicago has similarities to Detroit, Grand Rapids, and Pittsburgh while remaining something all its own. Chicago is definitely the hub for the Midwest and the good fortune of the economy in Chicago has allowed the city to have minimal population decrease and remain a culturally diverse and inspiring place.
CHAPTER 9:
CONCLUSION

Many post-industrial cities in the Midwest and Rustbelt region of the country are finding themselves going through a transitional period. Some see the arts as crucial to redeveloping communities and creating sustainable nightlife that aids the economy. A few cities have chosen to design and plan artistic communities, while other cities have had artistic movements emerge spontaneously in neighborhoods and captivate residents.

For policy makers going forward, the research presented above can aid in developing effective public policy. Yet, it is important to note that there will always be ambiguity with regards to how artistic communities are formed. It is not a clear choice between designed and planned artistic communities versus spontaneous artistic movements. Rather, it is a continuum. While some cities emphasized up-down approaches, others to try and establish a bottom-up (grassroots) approach but maintain organization and funding that can be provided from the top-down.

There are six central themes I've extracted from the research to further extrapolate on. These themes are: (1) the effects of urban planning on the creative environment of an artistic community; (2) cooperation between artists and neighborhood residents may limit gentrification; (3) artistic use of urban design in redevelopment is effective at strengthening communities; (4) grassroots artistic communities are fragile; (5) the impact of philanthropy in creating artistic communities; (6) and the fact that more research is needed on how artistic communities form and operate and there is still too much unknown information on their effect on urban planning.

1. URBAN PLANNING’S EFFECT ON THE CREATIVE ENVIRONMENT
There is a need in post-industrial cities to reinvent and revitalize their downtown areas. Many cities that were industrial hubs in the 20th century lacked the cultural influence and entertainment associated with world-class cities like New York, San Francisco, or Los Angeles have. One way to redevelop a downtown area has been by creating a cultural district to attract nightlife and attention to cities that are seeking an image change.

Pittsburgh is a compelling example of a city that has set out to re-image itself as a cultural hub. The cultural district in downtown Pittsburgh is a planned strip showcasing the works and talents of the Pittsburgh artistic community. Urban planning has been crucial in the creation of an artistic community in downtown Pittsburgh. Pittsburgh has done an excellent job of reforming their downtown area and the arts were a large part of the redevelopment process which has galvanized the downtown area.

One criticism of the planned artistic community is that, by virtue of its riverfront and downtown location, the Cultural District seems more like an entertainment spot for residents and tourists (similar to that of downtown Chicago) than of true artistic neighborhoods. The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust has control over most of the galleries and theaters that are in the Cultural District and most artists are finding it easier to operate outside of the largely planned district in more low-profile neighborhoods like Oakland where the spark of artistic energies conglomerated naturally. Areas that are designed with a focus on the arts have checks and balances over what artists can and cannot do there. The Pittsburgh Cultural Trust has so much authority that it accounts for all the art in the Cultural District. So, as a theater or art gallery, you have to stay in the good graces of the trust and what art projects and performances they feel are worthy or good enough for the Cultural District. There is a very slight form on censorship on part of the Trust and the city to make the Cultural District family friendly. You definitely do not see much controversial or even modern art displayed in downtown and those seeking more modern and unabashed art pieces must look elsewhere like the underground loft and warehouse art performance and gallery spaces in the city.
The test for Pittsburgh, if they can, is to integrate the spontaneous and DIY artistic movement of the younger generation with the planned artistic community of the downtown to cultivate an artistic community that gives artists more room to grow and expand their creative ideas. This could help infuse arts in the city and build stronger and sustainable communities.

The planning approach to artistic communities can be effective at making targeted areas economically successful, as seen in Pittsburgh and Grand Rapids, but they tend to have a built in bias of economic success and efficiency that doesn't always translate as being effective for fostering and cultivating sustainable artistic communities that can improve and help redevelop neighborhoods. Grand Rapids is a good example of a planned artistic movement that has generated a lot of money without necessarily cultivating a sustainable and established artistic community. ArtPrize has been very successful in bringing money, people, and attention to Grand Rapids, but at what cost to the local artistic community? While people visit Grand Rapids for the ArtPrize event, you don't hear about people permanently moving to Grand Rapids to pursue the arts as you do in Detroit.

ArtPrize is still so new. Many artists feel events like ArtPrize play down to the lowest common denominator and that it is art for the sake of economic success, but not necessary for the art. ArtPrize even has a store where they promote throughout the year and one can buy official ArtPrize merchandise. Artistic communities formed from grassroots actions--the common bond that brings people together and forms the community--is for art itself and not economic gain. This brings into question the intention of the arts in Grand Rapids as an attempt to build a new culture and showcase artistic ideas that inspire and can redevelop the city, or is ArtPrize a marketing campaign created by an organization as a way to bring new business and tourist dollars to the city?

The planning approach to artistic communities in post-industrial cities has been most effective in downtown areas like those in Pittsburgh, Grand Rapids, and Chicago. Redeveloping downtown areas
with a focus and intent on artistic integration can bestow nightlife to decaying areas and can revitalize development. If not handled properly, it can lead to distrust by the artistic community at large and can cause gentrification where then artists cannot even afford to live in areas that are designed to promote artistic cohesion with favorable economics.

2. IMPACT OF PHILANTHROPY

Another central theme that was predominant in my research is the impact philanthropy can have in designing artistic communities. Pittsburgh and Grand Rapids both share the similarity of having large philanthropic organizations invest and fund numerous programs and activities in the development of a planned artistic community. In the case of Pittsburgh, the Pittsburgh Cultural Trust and Heinz Foundations have invested millions of dollars into the development of the Cultural District. In Grand Rapids, the DeVo s Family and DeVo s Foundation put both the wheels for ArtPrize in motion and are the largest contributing organizations to the funding and operation of ArtPrize. When cities have large philanthropic donations it makes it a lot easier for planned artistic communities to be put into place through urban planning.

Detroit has some philanthropic organizations like the Kresge Foundation but nowhere near the philanthropic dollars that Pittsburgh and Grand Rapids have. In Grand Rapids, the city itself most likely would not be able to create and implement an artistic renaissance like ArtPrize has become but funding from philanthropic dollars has required little action from the city and ArtPrize is large enough of an organization to plan the event itself. A city like Detroit that is strapped for cash just doesn't have the ability for the city government or philanthropic organizations to plan and succeed in implementing an event like ArtPrize.

An interesting theme developed with my site visits: planned artistic communities tend to be produced and implemented where you have a large philanthropic donor base. Communities like those
in Detroit or Logan Square and Pilsen in Chicago, where those philanthropic funds are absent, tend to rely on the development of grassroots and spontaneously developed artistic communities. The role of philanthropic foundations in the formation and development of artistic communities is major contrast between what's happening in Detroit as compared to Grand Rapids and Pittsburgh.

3. COHESION BETWEEN ARTISTS & COMMUNITY RESIDENTS

An important aspect of an emerging artistic community is its relationship with the residents of the neighborhood in which artists live and interact. The arts can be a powerful tool to redevelop neighborhoods into vibrant and economically successful communities as seen in places like Wicker Park, Logan Square, and Pilsen in Chicago as well as Brightmoor in Detroit, Oakland in Pittsburgh, and Division Ave in Grand Rapids. The arts are a participatory process and public participation in interacting with artists is crucial in the formation and development of revitalizing neighborhoods and strengthening communities.

One criticism of artistic communities is they cause gentrification to occur by redeveloping neighborhoods and causing living costs to increase by attracting people with higher incomes and a willingness to spend more money to the area. Gentrification is not always bad, and from an urban planning standpoint can help in redeveloping communities and making them economically strong and can increase residential housing in the community. Gentrification can have negative effects on a neighborhood when it drives out lower income families and small businesses because of the rise in cost of living.

Social cohesion between lower income residents of a neighborhood and the artists who live beside them and try to redevelop the neighborhood is crucial as an artistic community emerges. By having interaction with the community residents and transparent public participation in art projects,
artists can work with community leaders and residents in defining and shaping the neighborhood in which they live. The emerging artistic movement of Detroit is a good example of where in neighborhoods like Brightmoor and North Hamtramck you have artists working with people in the community to promote activism and involvement. These communities in Detroit, as well as Pilsen and Logan Square in Chicago, have an exemplary cohesion between artists who have moved into the neighborhood and the residents already living there in rebuilding and strengthening their community.

Wicker Park is an example of a neighborhood where social cohesion did not occur and the original resident population and even eventually much of the original artists who redeveloped the neighborhood moved out due to rising costs of living from gentrification. Richard Lloyd has done a lot of research in the emergence of the redevelopment of the Wicker Park neighborhood. The community residents were not very accepting of the influx of creative types who moved into their neighborhood. A barrier grew between the artists and the general community, and when Wicker Park became known as an artist haven and a cool neighborhood to be in, the original residents were eventually driven out by gentrified housing lofts and new boutique businesses (Lloyd 2006).

From a policy standpoint, it is crucial to look at what happened in Wicker Park and try to create policies that allow for greater cohesion between the residents of Logan Square and the emerging artistic community of the younger creative class. Similarly, much of the future success in Detroit will depend on how the artistic community and neighborhoods continue to interact in redeveloping and attempting to revitalize communities, just as greater social cohesion in Grand Rapids between ArtPrize and the artistic community and city residents would aid in gaining more credibility for ArtPrize as being a legitimate artistic movement and more than a yearly art event.

4. ARTISTIC IMPACT ON URBAN REDESIGN

One important impact artistic communities have made in the redevelopment of broken
communities and fledgling neighborhoods is the use of creative redesign in residential homes, buildings, and public spaces to strengthen community bonds. Detroit is a great example of how artists who moved into neighborhoods with the common bond of the arts and artistic expression have cleaned up and redefined neighborhoods by redesigning homes, empty buildings, and park spaces to bring community residents together and help revitalize neighborhoods. The Heidelberg Project started as a way to take blighted and abandoned property and attempt to change the image of the neighborhood by making public art statements (Rodriquez 2011). Lisa Rodriquez (2011) stated, “Tyree's art has brought so much attention and participation from the public that the gang and drug activity that was so predominant in the area move out of the neighborhood.” Brightmoor is another example of where artists took abandoned houses and empty storefronts and used them as artistic canvases to create experimental public art pieces that have enthralled the community and given people hope in rebuilding a community that is safe and joined in common bonds. The Power House Project has taken redesigning communities to the next level and artists working and living there are attempting to create their own communities that do not need city services but rely on each other for support and work together in creating and promoting a sustainable crime-free livable community in the city of Detroit (Canilao 2011).

In the post-industrial cities I visited, a common theme was a large amount of empty warehouses, store fronts, and homes. Where many properties sat empty for years or even decades in some cases, artists need very little outside of electricity to make them useable again. Warehouse and loft art spaces are common in Pittsburgh, Detroit, Grand Rapids, and Chicago. In a neighborhood like Eastern Market in Detroit, an entire artistic movement arose from music and art shows done in personal lofts and empty warehouses. Pilsen is another neighborhood similar to Eastern Market where most of the emerging artistic movement does not take place in conventional public places, but in lofts, warehouses, and
public visual art pieces using empty storefronts and ugly brick buildings as a canvas to create provocative and attention grabbing artistic statements.

What policymakers and community residents can learn from artistic reuse of urban structures is not to fight it, but work to embrace and cultivate the process. The city of Detroit twice has ordered the demolition of homes that were part of the Heidelberg Project, but it did not stop the work of Tyree Guyton and other artists and the project is still alive and continuing to grow (Rodriquez 2011). Mayor Daley made a crusade against street art calling it graffiti, but street art is continued to be created in neighborhoods across the city. The Violet Hour, which is a nationally recognized bar in Wicker Park, even had a featured artist series where they would have an artist design a piece of street art that would cover the front of the building for an allotted amount of time. Artistic expression can't be suppressed and artistic communities will sprout up somewhere. Cities and art organizations need to embrace artistic communities where they arise and work to create policies that can best serve both artists and city residents.

5. FRAGILITY OF GRASSROOTS MOVEMENTS

One important aspect I learned over the course of my research is the fragility of artistic communities that emerge from grassroots creative movements. Many artists and community leaders who I interviewed conveyed the sense that grassroots based artistic communities can emerge and evolve very fast, and it's very easy to be unaware or loose contact with an emerging artistic community. Much of what is known about artistic communities is after the fact of their creation and very rarely in the incubation and actual emergence stage. With grassroots movements, their volatility can be a blessing or a curse. There are still too many factors involved to be able to see what causes grassroots movements to dissolve -- in some cases as fast as they emerge.

I had a difficult time trying to find individuals involved in underground artistic communities in
the post-industrial cities I visited. In Pittsburgh specifically, I tried to find a warehouse show and see how they operate, but I could not find anyone who knew any information about where current warehouse shows were happening. Yet they are happening and there are blogs and testimonies from artists about the underground DIY community. Detroit has a more transparent DIY grassroots community and that mostly derives from the mass influx of artists who are overtaking areas of the city. Walking around Detroit you will find posters for house shows and addresses posted on street signs or buildings. It is a different case in a city like Chicago, where the underground art movements and grassroots artistic community appears to be splintered into smaller, fragmented groups who operate without necessarily working with or knowing about other small underground communities.

One key to the sustainability of underground house and loft art spaces is public transportation. Many house venues that I'm aware of in Chicago (Summer Camp, Strangelight, Treasure Town, Friendship Fortress, Command Center, Cave House, and Lucky Gator Loft) are all located near public transportation. In Logan Square, much of the artistic community that has emerged there is on Milwaukee Ave and walking distance to the CTA Blue Line trains. It seems that many urban artistic communities form near or around public transportation, and for policy makers this is an important observation to note. In Detroit, the redevelopment of Midtown to attract the creative class is happening before the development of the light-rail system that is going to run up Woodward Ave. Only time will tell if a planned artistic community can develop there before the light-rail train system is running.

Many underground venues fail or don't gain enough support to make it out of the underground into the public sphere. In a large city like Chicago, no one I've talked to really knows how many impromptu house and warehouse art spaces are in operation. There seems to be no larger organization of the fragmented underground movements into one large, developed artistic community. Ultimately the strength of grassroots artistic communities lies in the participation of artists and the audience who
attend shows and are motivated to support this kind of community.

6. NEED FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

Artistic communities emerging in post-industrial cities in 21st century America are a fascinating development of urban life and have produced a densely layered social movement involved in redeveloping blighted urban neighborhoods that have a vast number of factors that influenced their creation, emergence, and continuation. This research has just cracked the surface of what is happening with artistic communities in relation to urban planning and what their various probable causes for creation are. There is not yet enough research available to thoroughly conclude where on the spectrum of centralized planning to spontaneous creative acts most of these artistic communities emerged.

There is strong correlated evidence to suggest that the robust influence of centralized planning by city government as well as philanthropic organizations in cities like Pittsburgh and Grand Rapids is an essential factor, yet those cities also contain organically emergent artistic communities as well. Detroit shows signs of the ever growing underground artistic movement that is grabbing the city, but there are also non-profit organizations like Next Detroit and the Kresge Foundation that are helping cultivate communities and encourage the arts. Their direct impact on the formation of the DIY artistic community is hard to measure. Chicago also shows very strong evidence of a grassroots founded artistic community that is helping to reshape and revitalize neighborhoods such as Logan Square and Pilsen, but there is still so much unknown information about the underground artistic communities of Chicago that it is difficult to quantify just how extensive it currently is.

As the artistic communities continue to develop and change in these four cities, by understanding the different needs of each artistic community in each city can help policy makers and planners understand what policies need to be put in place to have substantial impact on artistic
communities and community development. By examining the relationship between planned artistic communities and organically cultivated artistic communities that have been established in each city can hopefully aid in increasing the dialogue between community leaders and city governments and philanthropic organizations in how they want to shape their communities with regards to the arts, and what role each sector can play in that process. Further research is truly needed about each artistic community and the essential characteristics one needs in order to try and understand what policies can be made that will benefit each artistic community in a way that promotes growth and sustainability and doesn't hinder or minimize the potential they have in redeveloping neighborhoods with the transformative power of art.
RESOURCES


Canilao, Monica. Telephone interview. November 17, 2011.

Cinquanti, Marissa. Personal Interview. September 26, 2011.


http://www.dwellingplacegr.org/history-page


Huebacher, Ben. Personal interview. September 26, 2011.


Jones, Jeffrey. Telephone interview. October 25, 2011.


McReynolds, Lauren. Telephone interview. October 2, 2011.


   [http://issuu.com/juxtapoz/docs/juxtapoz_may_june_n20/57](http://issuu.com/juxtapoz/docs/juxtapoz_may_june_n20/57).


   [http://www.pgharts.org/about](http://www.pgharts.org/about).

Pittsburgh Department of City Planning. 2006. *Census: Pittsburgh the Hill District*. 105


Reed, Lex. Personal interview. October 16, 2011.


http://www.encyclopedia.chicagohistory.org/pages/257.html


Stryker, Mark. 2010. ArtPrize: Grand Rapids Overrun by Creativity. Detroit Free Press:

September 22, 2010.


Trentacost, Nick. Telephone interview. October 18, 2011.


http://www.uica.org/about.

U.S. Census Bureau. 2010. Annual Estimates of the Population of Metropolitan and Micropolitan


Williams, Ian. Telephone interview. October 20, 2011.